



Llywodraeth Cymru
Welsh Government

How do you measure a nation's progress?

Proposals for the national indicators to measure whether Wales is achieving the seven well-being goals in the Well-being of Future Generations (Wales) Act 2015.

Welsh Government response
to the consultation Issued : 22 March 2016

Table of Contents

Introduction	2
Consultation period	3
Detail of responses	3
Next steps	4
Format of the Government response	5
Section 1 (Questions 1 and 5).....	5
Section 2 (Response by proposed indicator)	9
Section 3 (Response to new indicators).....	22
Annex A – Comparison table	25

Introduction

1. In 2015 the National Assembly for Wales passed the Well-being of Future Generations (Wales) Act 2015 (“the Act”). The Act is about improving the social, economic, environmental and cultural well-being of Wales. The Act was made law in April 2015 and puts in place seven well-being goals for Wales. These are for a prosperous, resilient, healthier, more equal and globally responsible Wales, with a vibrant culture and thriving Welsh language. For further information on the Act please visit our website [here](#)¹.
2. If we are to collectively achieve these well-being goals we need a way of measuring progress so that we can all see if, for Wales as a whole, things are getting better. That is why the Act places a legal requirement on Welsh Ministers to set national indicators.
3. As part of developing the national indicators the Welsh Government published a consultation paper on 19 October 2015, which set out 40 proposed indicators to measure the seven well-being goals for Wales.
4. The indicators have an important role in helping to measure the progress made towards achieving the well-being goals by Wales as a whole. There will be a report published every year by the Welsh Government on progress made in Wales in achieving the seven well-being goals, using the national indicators. This is called the ‘Annual Well-being Report’; the first will be published in the financial year following the publishing of the national indicators. It is planned that this report will be published under the Code of Practice for Official Statistics.
5. The Annual Well-being Report must also be taken into account by the Future Generations Commissioner for Wales when they prepare and publish their ‘Future Generations Report’.

The annual well-being report will not only present our progress towards achieving the well-being goals for the whole population, but by including or referencing additional analysis it will measure progress, where appropriate for some indicators, for different demographic groups. This will help us to better understand how outcomes differ for different groups of the population.

6. The national indicators will also have a specific role as they must be referred to by Public Service Boards in Wales when they are analysing the state of economic, social, environmental and cultural well-being in their areas.
7. The Welsh Ministers are also under a requirement to set national milestones in relation to these national indicators. These have not been developed yet and were not part of the consultation on the national indicators.

¹ <http://gov.wales/topics/people-and-communities/people/future-generations-act>

Consultation period

8. As required by the Act the Welsh Government consulted with the specified public bodies subject to the Act, the Future Generations Commissioner for Wales (“the FGC”) and wider stakeholders.

Public consultation

9. The consultation ran from 19 October 2015 to 11 January 2016. The consultation paper was issued electronically to a wide range of stakeholders and was also made available on the Welsh Government website. The Welsh Ministers wrote to all public bodies subject to the Act in August 2015 and a consultation letter to Chief Executives (or relevant) was issued by the Chief Statistician for the Welsh Government inviting their views on the proposed indicator set.
10. Opportunities to engage further with stakeholders were sought during the consultation period. The key Welsh Government-led events were:
 - 22rd October 2015 – Swansea, Waterfront Museum
 - 23rd October 2015 – Cardiff, SWALEC Stadium
 - 28th October 2015 – Newtown, Elephant and Castle Hotel
 - 4th November 2015 – Llandudno, Venue Cymru
 - 3rd December 2015 – Newport, Christ Church Centre
11. Over 250 people attended these sessions, with delegates coming from a cross section of sectors, including in health, education, police, transport, planning, Local Authorities and community council members, as well as members of the public. These events were managed by Cynnal Cymru - Sustain Wales under contract to the Welsh Government.
12. Welsh Government officials also attended a range of other events to raise awareness of the consultation.

Consultation with the Future Generations Commissioner for Wales

13. The consultation with the FGC took place from the date of the appointment 1st February 2016 to 22 February 2016. As part of her response the FGC carried out a number of events with stakeholders to inform her response.

Detail of responses

14. In total 175 responses were received, this included:
 - 149 submitted by e-mail (including three late responses);
 - 25 submitted via the online form;
 - and the Future Generations Commissioner response was submitted following her appointment.The full text of non-confidential responses will be made available on the Welsh Government website.

15. The Welsh Government commissioned Old Bell 3 Ltd to independently analyse the responses received. The analysis report prepared by Old Bell 3 Ltd has been published separately on the consultation page of our [website](#)². This summary was of the 171 responses received by Old Bell 3 on 12 January. They were unable to include the analysis of the three late responses. The late responses and the analysis by Old Bell 3 Ltd have been taken into account by the Welsh Government when developing the final set of indicators.
16. Table 1 provides a breakdown of respondents. Respondents were assigned a category as part of the consultation analysis. A full list of respondents will be available on our consultation page [here](#)³. Table 1 below updates Table 1.1 from the Old Bell 3 Ltd analysis to include late responses and the response from the FGC.

Table 1 – Breakdown of respondents		
Sector	Responses (Number)	Responses (percent)
Individuals	20	11
Public Bodies	52	30
Businesses	3	2
Professional Bodies or Interest Groups	38	22
Third sector	55	31
Other	7	4
Total	175	100

17. We would like to take this opportunity to thank everyone who responded to the consultation and those who attended the consultation events for their contribution.
18. Of the 43 public bodies subject to the Act, 30 responded to this consultation. Seven of the responses to the consultation were received from organisations and individuals outside of Wales.

Next steps

19. Having considered the responses to the consultation and the views of the FGC, the first national indicators required under Section 10 of the Act were laid before the National Assembly for Wales on 16 March 2016. These can be found [here](#)⁴.
20. The 46 national indicators published and laid before the National Assembly for Wales on 16 March are to be read with the national indicators technical information document (*How to measure a nation's*

² <http://gov.wales/consultations/people-and-communities/future-generations-act-how-do-you-measure-a-nations-progress>

³ <http://gov.wales/consultations/people-and-communities/future-generations-act-how-do-you-measure-a-nations-progress>

⁴ <http://gov.wales/topics/people-and-communities/people/future-generations-act>

progress – National Indicators for Wales: Technical Document, March 2016) published by the Welsh Government. This contains supplementary technical information on each indicator including where the data will be sourced from; whether the indicators can be disaggregated by protected characteristics (as set out in the Equality Act 2010) and/or area, and contextual indicators (or other indicator frameworks) which would support analysis of the indicator over time. This can be found [here](#)⁵

21. Annex A provides a comparison against the draft 40 national indicators published in October 2015, with those laid before the National Assembly on 16 March 2016.
22. These national indicators must now be referred to by public services boards when they are analysing the state of economic, social, environmental and cultural well-being in their area. Public bodies are also strongly encouraged to consider these indicators when setting their well-being objectives as required by the Act. For more information on these requirements please view the [essentials guide](#), or if you are working for a public body please see our statutory guidance [here](#)⁶.

Format of the Government response

23. This document provides the Welsh Government response to the consultation, based on the independent analysis carried out by Old Bell 3 Ltd. The purpose of this document is not to respond to every individual suggestion made but to detail where and why amendments have been made to the list of indicators. The document is organised into three sections:-
 - Section 1: Response to consultation questions 1 (the proposed set as a whole) and 5 (how to communicate the indicators).
 - Section 2: Response to the 40 indicators proposed in the consultation.
 - Section 3: Response to the most common suggestions for new indicators arising from the consultation (as outlined in Table 2.3 of the Old Bell 3 Ltd report).

Section 1 (Questions 1 and 5)

24. The consultation document posed the following question:

Q1 – Do you agree or disagree that the proposed set of indicators, as a whole, fully assess whether progress is being made in achieving all the well-being goals?

⁵ <http://gov.wales/topics/people-and-communities/people/future-generations-act>

⁶ Shared Purpose : Shared Future – Statutory guidance on the Well-being of Future Generations (Wales) Act 2015 <http://gov.wales/topics/people-and-communities/people/future-generations-act/statutory-guidance>

25. The analysis of this question can be found on pages 6-10 of the consultation analysis report by Old Bell 3 Ltd.
26. The Welsh Government has considered this response and is pleased to find that there is a broad agreement for the proposed set of indicators. The Welsh Government accepts more development work is needed over time to measure some aspects of well-being not captured within the list, and to ensure that they are kept under review. Where changes have been made to this set these have been addressed in Section 2 and 3 of this report.

Contribution of indicators to well-being goals (para 2.4-5)

27. Some respondents reported concerns about the imbalance between the link between proposed indicators and the seven well-being goals as outlined on page 11 and 12 of the consultation document. The table presented in the document was intended to give an outline of how the draft indicators gave sufficient coverage across all the seven well-being goals in the Act. The responses have shown how there is much discussion and debate about which of the seven well-being goals are measured by which of the proposed indicators and this is to be encouraged given the need to understand the interrelationships between the well-being goals.

Grouping/Headlines (para 2.7)

28. There was a desire from some stakeholders for either a smaller set of indicators, or the identification of a small number of “headline” indicators to be supported by a wider set of other indicators. Other respondents felt that the number listed was appropriate to ensure a comprehensive view of progress against the well-being goals. We acknowledge that one of the audiences for the national indicators is the public at large and that the communication of them to track Wales’ progress is an important feature of the Act. We will consider how to improve the communication of the first set of indicators to gain traction with people and communities across Wales.
29. The inclusion of headline indicators would need to be considered carefully to ensure it was consistent with the purposes of the national indicators required under the Act. This is the most appropriate vehicle for engaging people on the potential for headline indicators and how we communicate the indicators. This would be subject to full consultation with stakeholders and the FGC in due course.
30. The Welsh Government considered the possibility of grouping indicators together, and recognises there are potential benefits in communicating the indicators by grouping them into different policy areas, themes or by type. The final indicators as laid are presented as a long list so that future communication of the indicators, including the potential for groupings, is not constrained. One of the benefits of not formally grouping the indicators at this stage is that it enables individual

organisations to group the indicators according to areas of work thus providing flexibility in how they are applied and understood.

Framing of the indicators (positive vs negative) (para 2.9)

31. By their very nature indicators will be measuring positive and negative aspects of the well-being of Wales. For many of the 'negatively' expressed indicators (such as poverty) these measures have a strong recognition and therefore to reverse their tense may lead to confusion amongst people using the indicators. Where appropriate indicators have been framed in the positive sense to indicate positive progress. The Future Trends Report, which will be published by Welsh Ministers, provides an opportunity to illustrate trends that may have a negative impact on Wales' well-being.

Balance of subjective and objective measures (para 2.11- 12)

32. Over reliance on subjective measures was cited as a concern. The Welsh Government is of the view that the nature of what we are measuring is the well-being of Wales and therefore this naturally lends itself towards more subjective measures, than would have otherwise been the case. By using solely objective measures we would miss the impact on the individual and their own sense of well-being and many aspects of the definitions of the well-being goals. Several of the more objective measures are often based on counting what we can easily measure, and whilst useful in context do not necessarily provide a rounded picture of outcomes. Within the presentation of the indicators we have highlighted areas where objective measures can be used to provide context to the subjective indicators, both in terms of the annual well-being report and by public services boards and public bodies in their own reporting.
33. The reliance on the National Survey for Wales was raised as a concern because 14 of the 40 proposed indicators identified the National Survey for Wales as their data source. The National Survey for Wales is carried out using standard government survey practice and is designed to be a robust and nationally representative survey. 12,000 residents of Wales will contribute to the National Survey each year. It is carried out by the Office for National Statistics on behalf of the Welsh Government. A large number of indicators come from this source as the Welsh Government has the ability to determine its content, and without the survey there would be a significant number of gaps in those areas which should be measured for the national indicators. Using a single source for several indicators will also allow them to be directly compared with one another, and analysed according to a range of demographic and other information.

Visibility of children

(para 2.13)

34. A significant gap was identified regarding indicators relating to children and young people. We accept that it would be beneficial to expand some of the indicators to ensure that the well-being of children and young people are measured. As part of this final set we have amended the indicator set and included indicators on
- Mental well-being for children through the Understanding Society Survey,
 - Healthy lifestyle indicator for children, and
 - Children's Welsh Language skills and use through the Census and future Welsh Language Use Surveys.
35. As indicators that rely on the National Survey are currently unavailable for children and young people, we will consider options for how we might develop appropriate indicators in going forward that allow a broader understanding of children's well-being.

Equality and protected characteristics

(para 2.14)

36. Understanding whether Wales is becoming more equal (Goal 4) means that we do need to know whether progress towards the well-being goals is being experienced by those with protected characteristics and from different socio-economic backgrounds. The issue of gender equality was also raised as a key theme of the consultation exercise. We believe that a single 'equality' indicator is neither desirable nor appropriate. In response to this we have identified within the list of indicators in the technical document which indicators it will be possible to disaggregate by protected characteristics. A new indicator on gender pay difference has also been added.

Q5 – How do you think we should communicate the national well-being indicators with the people and communities of Wales?

37. The analysis of this question can be found on pages 25-28 of the consultation analysis report by Old Bell 3 Ltd.

Understanding of well-being and the Act

(para 2.71)

Respondents provided numerous ideas regarding how best to communicate the national indicators and highlighted the challenges that exist in their communication. The Welsh Government is keen to ensure that as many people as possible understand the purpose of the national indicators in conjunction with the Future Trends Report, the Milestones and the Annual Well-being Report. The primary focus however for communication are the seven well-being goals provided for in the Act. The Welsh Government will be carrying out further work to consider how the national indicators are best communicated.

Section 2 (Response by proposed indicator)

38. For each of the proposed 40 draft indicators published in October 2015 we have provided a Welsh Government response to the consultation. Please note that the numbering for some indicators have changed between the draft set in October 2015, and those published in March 2016. A comparison table can be found in Annex A.

01	Babies born at a healthy weight
<p>This indicator has been retained (measurement clarified).</p> <p>The indicator will be based on single births and will be calculated as the percentage of births that are <2,500 grams. Source will be National Community Child Health Database (NCCHD).</p>	

02	Healthy life expectancy for all
<p>This indicator has been retained (measurement clarified).</p> <p>We have clarified that the measure will cover both overall healthy life expectancy and also the gap between the most and least deprived areas (using the slope index of inequality to measure the gap).</p>	

03	People making healthy lifestyle choices
<p>This indicator has been retained (measurement modified).</p> <p>There will be separate adult (16 plus) and child indicators. Child indicators have been developed using the Health Behaviour in School-aged Children (HBSC) survey which runs every four years. The child measure will be similar to the adult measure, but will exclude BMI due to a high level of non-response. HBSC covers school years 7-11 (children aged 11-16). The Child Measurement Programme for 4-5 year olds will provide contextual information on height and weight for young children.</p> <p>The indicator will be shown alongside the five that make it up (for adults). The measures will be the percentage who have fewer than two healthy lifestyle behaviours as the health benefits from moving from, say, one to two are seen to be better than those moving from, say, three to four. The adult measure will come from the National Survey.</p> <p>Sport will be retained as separate indicator due to its cultural, societal and economic benefits.</p>	

04	Young children developing the right skills
<p>This indicator has been retained (measurement source clarified).</p> <p>We believe it is important to ensure we are measuring child development at an early age as it is so critical to achieving the best start in life.</p> <p>The initial indicator is proposed to be based on the baseline assessment at the start of Reception Year obtained from the Foundation Phase Profile, although this will depend on assessment of data quality from the early years of collection. We will also need to consider the implications of the new curriculum in Wales on what is measured and captured at what age.</p> <p>In future we hope to use data through the Healthy Child Wales programme and Flying Start to develop an indicator at age 2 on all areas of child development to ensure children are developing healthily and that their cognitive skills are developing at the appropriate pace. This would not be through educational settings but from information derived from health visitors.</p>	

05	School leavers with skills and qualifications
<p>This indicator has been retained (description modified).</p> <p>It will be kept under review as part of work to implement the new school curriculum in Wales. We will consider how best to communicate the measure in the most effective manner and to ensure it is defined accurately (for pupils in year 11).</p> <p>At present sufficient data on wider skills are not available. Qualifications are important outcomes for young people and are a key indicator of future labour market outcomes.</p>	

06	Educated and skilled population
<p>This indicator has been retained (measurement expanded).</p> <p>In the absence of a routine data source relating to adult skills, we are proposing to continue measuring this indicator through qualification levels.</p> <p>We have noted the suggestion to include data on no or low qualifications and will expand the indicator to include a broader range of levels from the National Qualifications Framework.</p>	

07	People not in education, employment or training
<p>This indicator has been retained (measurement clarified).</p> <p>It has been modified to be defined as “percentage” of and to be positively framed (i.e. the percentage in education employment or training) rather than negative</p>	

08	People in work
<p>This indicator has been retained (no change).</p> <p>We will ensure that this indicator is interpreted in the context of indicator 07 (which focuses on younger people’s labour market status) and the new indicator added in response to comments on indicator 14, which will take into consideration pay and job security.</p>	

09	Productive workforce
<p>This indicator has been retained (no change).</p>	

10	Innovative businesses
<p>This indicator has been retained (description modified).</p> <p>The indicator’s definition will determined by the wording adopted in the Community Innovation Survey. We considered the point about sustainable innovation and judged that there was no inconsistency with approach set out in the Act.</p> <p>Further details on the Community Innovation Survey can be found here https://www.gov.uk/government/collections/community-innovation-survey</p>	

11	Levels of household income
<p>This indicator has been retained (no change).</p> <p>We considered further the issue of distribution of household income, and the use of median or mean average, but concluded that the Households Below Average income data source for median income that is used to measure indicator 12 was not sufficiently flexible to monitor change and to provide data at a local level. We also concluded that indicator 12 (alongside a new indicator on low pay) would provide an indication of progress made in terms of the distribution of income.</p>	

12	People living in poverty
<p>This indicator has been retained (measurement clarified).</p> <p>The consultation proposed that we measure poverty both in terms of relative income poverty and material deprivation, through the inclusion of both indicators 12 and 13. We will ensure these indicators are reported on together to provide a rounder picture of poverty.</p> <p>We confirm that we will be using UK median income for this measure.</p> <p>The material deprivation questions used to measure indicator 13 include measures on fuel poverty and indebtedness which can be analysed as part of our consideration of these indicators.</p>	

13	People able to afford everyday goods and activities
<p>This indicator has been retained (description modified).</p> <p>The consultation proposed that we measure poverty both in terms of relative income poverty and material deprivation, through the inclusion of both indicators 12 and 13.</p> <p>As stated above we will ensure these indicators are reported on together to provide a rounder picture of poverty.</p> <p>The material deprivation questions used to measure this indicator include measures on fuel poverty and indebtedness which can be analysed as part of our consideration of these indicators.</p>	

14	People satisfied in their jobs
<p>This indicator has been retained (description modified).</p> <p>A new indicator has also been added in response to concerns that job satisfaction was did not provide a rounded picture of “decent work”. The new indicator covers both levels of pay and job security.</p> <p>The technical document to be published alongside the indicators includes a reference to the International Labour Organization (ILO) main indicators and United Nations indicators on decent work with particular reference to those indicators most relevant to the Welsh context.</p>	

15	People satisfied with where they live
<p>This indicator has been retained (no change).</p> <p>The indicator will provide an overall picture of people’s satisfaction with where they live. In some years this can be unpicked by the inclusion of other</p>	

measures, such as:

- People satisfied with the state of their local environmental quality
- People satisfied with the levels of noise in their area

These will provide extra context for understanding the indicator.

16	A sense of community
-----------	-----------------------------

This indicator has been retained (no change).

As the consultation identified no common or specific improvements, this indicator has been retained.

17	People feel involved in local decision making
-----------	--

This indicator has been retained (no change).

The indicator will provide a picture of how people feel about their ability to influence local decision making. The Welsh Government has adopted this approach rather than voter turnout. Research has shown that voter turnout is not a good measure of political engagement at the local level. Voter turnout presupposes a particular mode of getting involved (voting), and does not account for other methods. Figures for local elections tend to be consistently low. However, voting figures can be looked at to provide context for the indicator.

18	People who volunteer
-----------	-----------------------------

This indicator has been retained (no change).

Volunteering via organised groups will be measured by a new question developed for the 2016-17 National Survey. Volunteering in the form of caring for family, friends or neighbours will be measured using a previous Welsh Health Survey question included in the 2016-17 National Survey.

19	People satisfied with access to facilities and services
-----------	--

This indicator has been retained (no change).

A new question will be developed for the 2017-18 National Survey. This will provide an overall picture of satisfaction with access to services and facilities. In some years this can be unpicked by other measures, such as access to open/green spaces, transport, public services and local amenities. These measures will provide context for the high-level indicator.

20	People feeling safe in their communities
<p>This indicator has been retained (no change).</p> <p>The National Survey questions will provide an indication of whether people feel safe without assuming a particular cause. Objective measures, such as crime figures, are known to be problematic. Reporting rates for some crimes are on the rise – this does not necessarily indicate rising crime rates – while other crimes are known to be under reported. Recorded crime and statistics on fear of crime can be used as context for the indicator, as will the indicators being developed under the Violence against Women, Domestic Abuse and Sexual Violence (Wales) Act 2015</p>	

21	People feeling lonely
<p>This indicator has been retained (no change).</p> <p>As no suggestions for improvements were identified, this indicator will be retained. The De Jong Gierveld Loneliness scale has been identified, but not collected previously. The source will be the National Survey for Wales.</p>	

22	Positive mental wellbeing for all
<p>This indicator has been retained (no change).</p> <p>The mean score will be used to monitor this indicator. The adults measure will come from the National Survey for Wales.</p> <p>There will be a separate child measure which could come from Understanding Society (using the Strengths and Difficulties Questionnaire) and would also be based on a mean score.</p>	

23	Quality of housing
<p>This indicator has been retained (no change).</p> <p>Ministers have recently agreed in principle to the implementation of a programme of work to capture data on housing conditions in Wales and have committed some initial funding to support the development phase of the programme. Final commitment to the full funding of a housing conditions survey will be sought later in the year.</p> <p>As a measure to track progress ahead of any new indicator being available, we will retain the proposed indicator on hazards.</p>	

24	Levels of homelessness
<p>This indicator has been retained (measurement modified).</p> <p>We have changed this indicator to one based on prevention. Whilst the feedback was mixed in response to the question posed in the consultation, we considered that the arguments in favour of measuring prevention were persuasive and using an indicator of prevention would be in keeping with the aims of the Act.</p> <p>Data on rough sleepers collected through the Rough Sleeper Count will be very useful to public bodies in their assessment of need and as context to the prevention indicator, but we do not consider it sufficiently robust to be an appropriate national indicator.</p>	

25	People engaged in arts, culture and heritage
<p>This indicator has been retained (measurement clarified).</p> <p>The list of activities to be included and scope (wherever activity takes place) has been agreed. They will include those activities that are currently monitored by in the Arts Council of Wales (Arts in Wales Survey), plus visits to heritage/historic sites and visits to/use of libraries, museums and archives.</p> <p>Currently the National Survey for Wales does not capture data in this exact form however; it will be captured through the NSW following development work on the questions.</p>	

26	People using Welsh Language in everyday life
<p>This indicator has been retained and split into two indicators (New indicators 36 and 37).</p> <p>We have split this indicator into two in response to the feedback received, to measure those that can speak Welsh and those who speak more than just a few words of Welsh and speak it on a daily basis. We have also decided to use consistent data sources to measure Welsh language use in the broadest sense for both children and adults. However such measures rely on the decennial Census and any future occasional Welsh Language Use Surveys therefore as contextual information we will use the National Survey for Wales and the Pupil-Level Annual School Census to track progress.</p> <p>We consider that in terms of Future Generations we should retain the aim for daily use of the Welsh Language.</p>	

27	People participate in sports
<p>This indicator has been retained (no change).</p> <p>The sources are different for children and adults. As different measures are used to calculate those who participate three or more times a week for children and young people and for adults, then we can't directly compare the percentages. The adult measure will come from the National Survey (formerly Active Adults Survey) whilst the child measure will come from the School Sport Survey undertaken by Sports Wales.</p>	

28	Looking after our cultural heritage
<p>This indicator has been retained and split into two indicators (New indicators 39 and 40).</p> <p>We aim to use two measures, one for designated historic environment assets (castles, scheduled ancient monuments and listed buildings) and one for museums, libraries and archives. For historic assets we will measure the percentage that is in stable or improved condition. Libraries, archives and museums have UK accreditation standards for the management of their collections. We intend to use the percentage of libraries and archives that have been assessed as meeting the UK archives accreditation standards and of museums that have been assessed as meeting the UK museum accreditation standards.</p> <p>We considered whether to include an indicator about the quality of our landscapes but concluded that that data, even though not assessed and updated regularly, could nevertheless provide useful contextual information in relation to looking after our cultural heritage.</p>	

29	Properties at risk from flood
<p>This indicator has been retained (no change).</p> <p>The flood risk mapping that is undertaken to derive this data takes into account the National Land and Property Gazetteer and is based on seas, rivers and (all but the very smallest) ordinary watercourses. Risk maps of surface water flooding are prepared but are less robust than the risk mapping from seas and rivers. Risk from seas, rivers and surface water are not combined as some properties may be included on both risk maps and therefore double-counting is likely.</p> <p>Properties protected by investment in new flood defences is not considered to be an outcome indicator. If additional properties are protected by new investment the number of properties at risk of flooding should be reduced.</p>	

30	Energy efficiency of buildings
<p>This indicator has been retained (no change).</p> <p>No change proposed for measuring this initially but we will continue to review the potential for the capture of data on energy efficiency of non-residential buildings. In addition, as Ministers have recently agreed in principle to the implementation of a programme of work to capture data on housing conditions in Wales and have committed some initial funding to support the development phase of the programme, we will continue to review whether improved data will become available on the energy efficiency of dwellings.</p>	

31	Greenhouse gas emissions
<p>This indicator has been retained and option C from the consultation has been adopted (New indicator 41 and 42).</p> <p>Following on from stakeholder feedback we are now looking to report on emissions through 2 main ways for a robust assessment, which will be:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Emissions from what we produce in Wales, which will be reported annually and produced from the by-source greenhouse gas inventory (option A) • A footprint basis of Welsh consumer emissions (option C), which will be reported every 5 years. <p>Since the consultation was issued, the Environment (Wales) Act 2016 has been passed by the Assembly and received Royal Assent. The Environment (Wales) Act 2016 introduces a requirement to report on territorial emissions on a net account basis, with a supporting carbon budgeting framework underneath. It also introduces reporting on a footprint basis (Welsh consumer emissions). This means that stakeholder proposals for a carbon footprint indicator are now fulfilled directly by the Environment (Wales) Act reporting requirements. In addition, this means that going forward as well as reporting under the Environment (Wales) Act 2016 framework, we will also be reporting annually total (by-source) emissions.</p>	

32	Healthy ecosystems
<p>This indicator has been refined (measurement clarified).</p> <p>The consultation highlighted the need to develop measures for this indicator, drawing on the work of the State of Natural Resources Report.</p> <p>We recognised the challenge of measuring healthy ecosystems with a single measure, but agree that it is important to include an indicator that gave a better picture of the health of ecosystems in Wales. We concluded that whilst the draft indicators on a biodiverse natural environment, water and soil and air quality provided some of that picture there remained a gap.</p>	

In looking at the indicators available we decided to measure the area of healthy ecosystems in Wales, and this would initially be by measuring the extent of terrestrial semi-natural habitat, presented as losses and gains of broad habitat group by area (hectares). This does not on its own account fully for healthy ecosystems but provides a proxy as these habitats are usually more diverse, support a wider range of ecosystem services, and work better as larger more connected units. Going forward further refinement will be needed to provide a more holistic picture, and this will be developed as part of the State of Natural Resources Report work.

Data about the area of habitats sensitive to air pollution where critical loads of pollutants (nutrient nitrogen and acidity) are exceeded will provide additional useful contextual information.

33	A biodiverse natural environment
-----------	---

This indicator has been refined (measurement clarified).

The consultation highlighted the need to develop measures for this indicator, drawing on the work of the State of Natural Resources Report. It highlighted that whilst a robust high level indicator of biological diversity is not readily available, consideration would be given to the best available indicator.

In looking at the indicators available and in the context of the Environment (Wales) Act 2016, the “Status of biological diversity in Wales” has been chosen as the preferred national indicator. This would initially use the methodology for the “UK Biodiversity indicator C4b: status of priority species (distribution)”, as developed by the Joint Nature Conservation Committee (JNCC) for the UK.

We recognise that the refined national indicator cannot on its own fully account for the variety and abundance of the biological diversity of our natural environment in Wales. The status of priority species is, however, an important measure and initially can provide a useful proxy for the bigger picture on the variety and abundance of biological diversity. Going forward further refinement will be needed to provide a more holistic picture, and will be developed as part of the State of Natural Resources Report work.

34	Water quality
-----------	----------------------

This indicator has been retained (description modified).

We have introduced a minor change to wording of the indicator: Percentage of surface water bodies and groundwater bodies achieving good *or high overall* status under the Water Framework Directive.

As before, we recognise that the quality of bathing water will continue to be monitored with data being made available but that this indicator was considered to be a better high-level indicator on water quality.

35

Air quality

This indicator has been retained (measurement clarified).

We have changed this indicator to one based on levels of nitrogen dioxide (NO₂) pollution in the air. We noted the alternative indicator proposed by a number of respondents which is based on concentrations of PM_{2.5}, PM₁₀ and NO₂. This proposal relied on data from monitoring stations across Wales. However we concluded that using such measured data only would be inappropriate, potentially misleading and provide unrepresentative data, as

- monitoring locations are not evenly distributed across Wales and thus an indicator based solely on monitoring data would not provide representative information on average population exposure;
- Monitoring locations are predominantly selected where there is a suspicion that one or more air quality target will not be met. In other words, we generally monitor air pollution where we expect it to be worst. Any indicator based solely on this data will give the impression that average pollutant exposure in Wales is much higher than it actually is.
- Monitoring locations (both passive and automatic) can and will be moved when circumstances change, e.g. to investigate other pockets of suspected air pollution. This would invalidate annual average trends and make inter-annual comparisons meaningless
- Diffusion tube data are associated with a high level of uncertainty and should only be used indicatively.
- A national or local authority air quality indicator derived solely from measured concentrations would be susceptible to distortion by localised interventions that improve air quality in the immediate vicinity of the measurement sites but that have little, no, or even adverse impacts on air quality in locations where there are no monitors present. If we seek to maximise the benefits of improved air quality for the population as a whole, we must have an indicator that reflects widespread air quality improvements not just highly localised ones

A move away from the original proposal relating to particulate air pollution (PM_{2.5}) to nitrogen dioxide, but deriving the indicator from nationally modelled pollutant exposure figures (noting that the model used is calibrated/validated against measurements) rather than raw measured data, should more adequately reflect air quality improvements that occur over a wide populated area, rather than those confined to the immediate vicinity of air quality monitors. It will provide a robust indicator of the population's overall exposure to air pollution.

Data from the Air Quality in Wales website and the Public Health outcomes framework (when finalised) will provide some of the contextual information for this indicator.

36	Soil quality
<p>This indicator has been retained (no change).</p> <p>The monitoring system in place for this (the Glastir Monitoring and Evaluation Programme) includes sampling across 300 x 1km squares in Wales from across all of Wales' land classes, including the peri urban and coastal fringe. Roughly half of these 1km squares fall within the Glastir area and half outside of that area. . It is therefore not primarily an agriculture or rural issue, though it does exclude densely developed city areas and should not, therefore be considered an inventory of brownfield sites. Contaminated land and its remediation is likely to be included as part of the State of Natural Resource Report prepared by Natural Resources Wales and would be relevant contextual information to point to in the Annual Well-being report.</p>	

37	Non-recycled waste
<p>This indicator has been retained (description clarified).</p> <p>This indicator will remain as proposed though we have clarified the wording.</p> <p>This indicator was chosen to take account of not just how much waste is generated at source but also the way it is treated. It will be possible to make a distinction between business and household waste and other information about the total waste generated, whether or not it is recycled, household waste per person and recycling rates will provide a useful context to this indicator.</p>	

38	Global footprint
<p>This indicator has been retained (measurement clarified).</p> <p>Historically Wales has used the Ecological Footprint as a measure of whether Wales is developing in a more sustainable way. It remains a useful communication tool, particularly in explaining the commitment to achieve a 'One Planet Nation' within a generation as set out in the statutory Sustainable Development Scheme. There are however some limits to this as an indicator, which were identified by the Commissioner for Sustainable Futures and stakeholders. On balance, we feel that this indicator remains a useful proxy for whether Wales is developing in a sustainable way.</p> <p>In looking at what is being developed to measure the United Nations Sustainable Development Goals, a material footprint has been suggested. Some stakeholders also suggested that this should be a national indicator under the Act. We believe there is some merit in measuring our society's consumption of materials as an indicator of progress against the well-being goals. At this stage we do not propose that it becomes one of the national set until agreement has been reached on its definition for the UN SDGs and how</p>	

this will work at the UK level, including data collection.

In view of this we will retain the ecological footprint as a national indicator which will be reported on a periodic basis. We have identified the material footprint as contextual data to be considered alongside the Ecological Footprint. This will also be complemented by the inclusion of an indicator on Welsh consumer emissions.

39	Active global citizens
-----------	-------------------------------

This indicator has been removed and replaced by a new indicator on partnerships for the UN Sustainable Development Goals.

As laid out in the consultation there are challenges in defining what is meant by a global citizen. Useful representations were given about activities that related to the work on Education for Sustainable Development and Global Citizenship, and subsequent work at the UN. Many of these proposed a wide range of activities to be measured which could not usefully be simplified to one or two questions.

Much emphasis has been given in the implementation of the UN Sustainable Development Goals to the role of civil society and multi-stakeholder partnerships and several responses alluded to such links within and outside of Wales. We therefore looked again at what the UN were doing in the context of Goal 17 and their proposal under target 17.17 to focus on “*Encourage and promote effective public, public-private and civil society partnerships, building on the experience and resourcing strategies of partnerships*”. Such partnerships provide a focus for Welsh active global citizens – many of whom are already involved in the work of NGOs focussed on SDG implementation.

The United Nations Independent Expert Advisory Group have proposed that target 17.17 is measured by the amount of *United States* dollars committed to public-private and civil society partnerships. We considered this was a good basis to develop a national indicator but felt that a crude measurement of money spent would not capture the full impact of largely voluntary action in support of achievement of the SDGs. It was in response to the challenge of placing a financial value on all the activities of third sector organisations that the Social Return on Investment (SROI) framework was considered. The framework enables organisations to place a value on all of the inputs that their activities require and also the social, environmental and economic benefits resulting from their activities. With these valuations we will be able to tell a story that demonstrates the impact of their actions beyond the financial.

We will also consider whether indicator 18 which measures volunteering can also capture information on international activities rather than as a separate indicator.

40	International responsibilities
<p>This indicator has been removed (to be incorporated into the reporting process).</p> <p>There was support from those that responded to this indicator that a qualitative approach could be effective in communicating how Wales is meeting its international responsibilities. These responsibilities are well documented and may change over time, and in certain areas Wales has gone further to legislate or make clear policy commitments to advance these obligations (for example the United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child). Some of these also have their own measurement frameworks in place. Given the need to lay before the National Assembly clear measurable indicators, this indicator has not been included in the final proposed set of indicators. However we will consider what role the Annual Well-being Report could play in communicating progress against international responsibilities.</p>	

Section 3 (Response to new indicators)

39. The following table provides a response to the more common new indicators suggested in the consultation (see table 2.3 in the consultation analysis). We have not sought to respond to each and every new indicator proposed.

PROPOSED	Access to open green spaces
<p>Measured by : Percentage of people with access to high quality green space – measured via NRW, WIMD, NSW or Open Space assessment conducted by LAs</p>	
<p>Should be considered as contextual data for the indicator on people satisfied with access to services and facilities (19) Questions in National Survey for Wales could cover this.</p>	

PROPOSED	Noise
<p>Percentage of people affected by noise. Data source: annual returns published by Chartered Institute of Environmental Health of population exposure on European Noise Directive maps</p>	
<p>Should be considered as contextual data for the indicator on people satisfied with where they live (15) Questions in National Survey for Wales could cover this. Noise mapping is also available to provide contextual information.</p>	

PROPOSED	Quality of the local environment
	Local Environmental Audit and Management System (LEAMS) surveys (which record street cleanliness by measuring litter and adverse environmental quality indicators such as fly-posting and dog fouling)
	Should be considered as contextual data for the indicator on people satisfied with where they live (15) Questions in National Survey for Wales could cover this, whilst data from the Local Environmental Audit and Management Systems will also provide context.

PROPOSED	Looking after our landscapes
	No clear proposal provided though suggestions it could be incorporated into indicator 28 (looking after our cultural heritage). NRW suggested the use of Landmap.
	Following investigation of the potential for including an indicator on the percentage of area of landscapes in Wales evaluated as outstanding or high quality in relation to visual and sensory benefits, we concluded that such data, even though not assessed and updated regularly, could nevertheless provide useful contextual information in relation to looking after our cultural heritage..

PROPOSED	Percentage of energy generated from renewables
	Percentage of energy generated from renewables, Data source: DECC
	<p>We do not believe that percentage of energy generated from renewables would be a useful national indicator as it is prone to considerable distortions from one year to the next due to the impact of change in production from non-renewable sources which are providing energy to the national grid.</p> <p>Instead the greenhouse gas emissions indicator will be presented by sector thus indicating any changes due to energy production and a new indicator on the capacity (in MW) of renewable energy equipment installed has been included</p>

PROPOSED	Land assessed and remediated from contamination
Area of land formerly designated as being contaminated brought back into beneficial use, measured via LA and NRW records	
Contaminated land and its remediation is likely to be included as part of the State of Natural Resource Report prepared by Natural Resources Wales and would be relevant information to point to in the Annual Well-being report.	

PROPOSED	Farming and Food Production
No common indicator/measure proposed though a view expressed that it was not adequately covered	
<p>In terms of agricultural productive capacity, the soil quality indicator was considered to provide a high-level indicator on quality of soil across Wales useful for considering ecosystem health as well as agricultural productive capacity. Some suggested indicators on food consumption which is Welsh sourced would be very difficult to measure.</p> <p>We are not proposing to include an indicator on farming or food production but it would be relevant to draw out the link between farming and soil quality.</p>	

PROPOSED	Carbon emissions per head of population
GHG emissions from Wales per head of population	
Greenhouse gas emissions are included as a national indicator. In addition, and to align with the requirements of the Environment (Wales) Act 2016 Welsh consumer emissions will be a national indicator.	

PROPOSED	Materials Footprint
Total materials used (including imported goods and services)	
Consideration being given to including this as part of the indicator on global footprint. Please see response to Indicator 38 above.	

Annex A – Comparison table

Comparison between draft indicators (October 2015) and proposed indicators (March 2016)

The following table compares the 40 draft indicators published for consultation in October 2015, against the list of 46 indicators to be laid before the National Assembly for Wales on 16 March 2016.

Key	
	Retained
	Retained but modified
	Removed
	New

Proposed National Indicators (October 2015)		Change	National Indicators (March 2016)	
1	Number of live births with a birth weight of under 2,500g.	Retained – amended to clarify measurement is percentage	1	Percentage of live single births with a birth weight of under 2,500g.
2	The gap in healthy life expectancy at birth between the least and most deprived.	Retained – amended to clarify inclusion of overall figures for population as well as the gap	2	Healthy life expectancy at birth including the gap between the least and most deprived.
3	The percentage of adults (aged 16+) who have four or five healthy lifestyle behaviours (not smoking, healthy weight, eat five fruit or vegetables a day, not drinking above guidelines and meet the physical activity guidelines).	Retained - measurement modified.	3	Percentage of adults who have fewer than two healthy lifestyle behaviours (not smoking, healthy weight, eat five fruit or vegetables a day, not drinking above guidelines and meet the physical activity guidelines).
4	Initially percentage of children in Reception year at expected level of development. To be replaced by measure at ages 2 or 3 once data are consistently available across Wales.	Retained – source of measurement clarified.	6	Measurement of development of young children. This is proposed to be calculated using data from the Foundation Phase Baseline Assessment for children aged 4-5 which is derived from the Foundation Phase Profile .

					This is a new data source and the indicator will be developed over time.
5	Initially the percentage of 15 year old pupils who have achieved the “Level 2 threshold”. ⁷ This measures the volume of qualifications equivalent to the volume of 5 GCSEs at Grade A*-C including one in English or Welsh first language and one in Mathematics.		Retained – technical changes to measurement	7	Percentage of pupils who have achieved the “Level 2 threshold” including English or Welsh first language and Mathematics, including the gap between those who are eligible or are not eligible for free school meals. (To be replaced from 2017 by the average capped points score).
6	Percentage of working age adults with level 3 ⁸ or above qualifications (that is A-level, Apprenticeship or equivalent), and those with level 4 or above (Higher Education or equivalent).		Retained and expanded to include broader view of qualifications	8	Percentage of adults with qualifications at the different levels of the National Qualifications Framework.
7	Annual measures of those people Not in Education Employment or Training (NEET) for different age groups.		Retained - changes to wording to clarify measurement.	22	Percentage of people in education, employment or training, measured for different age groups.
8	Working age employment rate according to International Labour Organisation (ILO) definition.		Retained –changes only to wording	21	Percentage of people in employment.
9	Labour productivity: Gross Value Added (GVA) per hour worked (relative to UK average).		Retained – no change	9	Gross Value Added (GVA) per hour worked (relative to UK average).
10	Share of businesses which are innovation-active (%).		Retained – technical changes to wording of indicator	11	Percentage of businesses which are innovation-active.
11	Gross Disposable Income per head.		Retained – no change	10	Gross Disposable Household Income per head.
12	Households in relative income poverty, measured for children, working age and those of pension age.		Retained – no change, clarified that it is based on UK median	18	Percentage of people living in households in income poverty relative to the UK median: measured for children, working age and those of pension age.
13	National Survey questions used to produce measure of percentage of households in material deprivation.		Retained –technical changes to wording of indicator	19	Percentage of people living in households in material deprivation.
14	Proportion of people in employment who report satisfactory or higher levels of jobs satisfaction.		Retained – changes to wording of indicator	20	Percentage of people moderately or very satisfied with their jobs.
15	Percentage satisfied with local area as a place		Retained – no change	26	Percentage of people satisfied with local area as a

	to live.				place to live.
16	Percentage of people agreeing with all of: belonging to the area; that people from different backgrounds get on well together; that people treat each other with respect.	Retained – no change		27	Percentage of people agreeing that they belong to the area; that people from different background get on well together; and that people treat each other with respect.
17	Percentage who feel able to influence local decisions affecting their local area.	Retained – minor wording change		23	Percentage who feel able to influence decisions affecting their local area.
18	The proportion of people who volunteer.	Retained – minor wording change		28	Percentage of people who volunteer.
19	A subjective measure on how satisfied people are with their ability to get to/access the facilities and services they need. Yet to be developed.	Retained – measurement clarified		24	Percentage of people satisfied with their ability to get to/ access the facilities and services they need.
20	Percentage of people feeling safe in all of the following situations: at home, walking in the local area, and travelling (all transport modes).	Retained – minor change to wording		25	Percentage of people feeling safe at home, walking in the local area, and when travelling.
21	De Jong Giervald Loneliness scale.	Retained – measurement clarified		30	Percentage of people who are lonely.
22	For those aged 16 or over, mental well-being according to the Warwick-Edinburgh Mental Well-being Scale (WEMWBS). Measurement to be confirmed for children.	Retained – wording amended		29	Mean mental well-being score for people.
23	Percentage of dwellings which are free from Housing Health and Safety rating system hazards.	Retained – no change but potential for development of improved source of data in future		31	Percentage of dwellings which are free from hazards.
24	Number of homeless households per 1,000 households.	Retained - measurement modified to prevention		34	Number of households successfully prevented from becoming homeless per 10,000 households.
25	The percentage of adults (aged 16+) attending or participating in arts, culture or heritage activities at least 3 times a year.	Retained – no change, though measure defined more precisely		35	Percentage of people attending or participating in arts, culture or heritage activities at least three times a year.
26	Percentage of adults who speak more than a few words of Welsh and speak Welsh daily and	Retained – Split in to two Indicators number		36	Percentage of people who speak Welsh daily and can speak more than just a few words of Welsh.

	percentage of children who are fluent and speak Welsh at home.				
		36 and 37			
		New indicator (see indicator 36 above)		37	Percentage of people who can speak Welsh
27	Participation in sporting activities three or more times a week, measured separately for children and adults.	Retained – no change		38	Percentage of people participating in sporting activities three or more times a week.
28	Data on protection of, access to and enhancement of cultural heritage assets including collections, sites, buildings and places.	Retained – Split in to two indicators number 39 and 40		40	Percentage of designated historic environment assets that are in stable or improved conditions.
		New indicator (see indicator 40 above)		39	Percentage of museums and archives holding archival/heritage collections meeting UK accreditation standards.
29	Number of properties (homes and businesses) at combined high and medium flood risk from rivers and the sea.	Retained – no change		32	Number of properties (homes and businesses) at medium or high risk of flooding from rivers and the sea
30	Residential: Percentage of properties or dwellings above an agreed Standard Assessment Procedure (SAP) rating. Non-residential: To be developed.	Retained – changes to wording		33	Percentage of dwellings with adequate energy performance
31	Emissions of greenhouse gases (exact measure to be determined).	Retained – measurement defined and split with 42		41	Emissions of greenhouse gases within wales
		New indicator (as per consultation two indicators for GHG) (see indicator 41 above)		42	Emissions of greenhouse gases attributed to the consumption of global goods and services in Wales.
32	Healthy ecosystems – measurement to be agreed.	Refined – measurement defined		43	Area of healthy ecosystems in Wales
33	A biodiverse natural environment – measurement to be agreed	Refined – measurement defined		44	Status of biological diversity in Wales
34	Percentage of surface water bodies and groundwater bodies achieving good overall status under the Water Framework Directive.	Retained – wording expanded to refer to “good or high”		45	Percentage of surface water bodies, and groundwater bodies, achieving good or high overall status.
35	Proportion of deaths attributable to long-term	Retained -		4	Levels of nitrogen dioxide (NO2) pollution in the air.

