Annual and final implementation reports for the Investment for growth and jobs goal

PART A

IDENTIFICATION OF THE ANNUAL/FINAL IMPLEMENTATION REPORT

CCI	2014UK16RFOP006
Title	United Kingdom - ERDF East Wales
Version	2016.0
Date of approval of the report by the monitoring committee	16-Jun-2017

2. OVERVIEW OF THE IMPLEMENTATION OF THE OPERATIONAL PROGRAMME (ARTICLE 50(2) AND 111(3)(A) OF REGULATION (EU) NO 1303/2013)

2.1. Key information on the implementation of the operational programme for the year concerned, including on financial instruments, with relation to the financial and indicator data.

By the end of December 2016 the Programme had made good progress with a total of 23 operations approved (mainly consisting of key backbone operations). Some €282.5m of total eligible costs has been committed; of which just over €128.8m of EU Grant has been awarded (around 63% of the EU funds available under the Programme). WEFO had its own internal target to meet 60% EU Grant commitment of the four main regional Structural Funds Programmes by the end of November 2016 which WEFO met.

In terms of the EU funds available, EU Grant commitment stood at 79% of the funds available under Priority 1 (Research and Innovation) by the end of December 2016, where most of the key elements of the Priority are in place through a number of backbone operations. A call for innovative proposals that can successfully translate research and innovation into new and improved commercial products, processes and services was launched towards the end of 2016, and will also aim to address potential shortfalls in indicator targets. EU Grant commitment stood at 97% of the funds available under Priority 2 (SME Competitiveness) by the end of December 2016, where the key elements of the Priority now in place. An integrated portfolio has been developed around operations that make up the 'Business Wales Family' encompassing Welsh Government, Wales Co-Operative Centre, Finance Wales and the Wales Council for Voluntary Action. The Wales Business Fund, a Financial Instrument, was launched in September 2016 and had already made good progress by the end of 2016, investing £4.0m in 10 SMEs in the Programme area. EU Grant commitment stood at 20% of the funds available under Priority 3 (Renewable Energy and Energy Efficiency) by the end of December 2016, where work continues to develop operations across all of the Priority's Specific Objectives. The Arbed 3 strategic operation, which aims to improve energy efficiency in housing, was approved during 2016. EU Grant commitment stood at 24% of the funds available under Priority 4 (Connectivity and Urban Development) by the end of December 2016, where two broadband operations were approved. Progress also continued to be made on proposals for the Metro Phase 2. EU Grant commitment stood at 88% of the funds available under Priority 5 (Technical Assistance) by the end of December 2016, where all of the Technical Assistance operations have now been approved.

By the end of December 2016 just over €46.0m had been declared by beneficiaries to WEFO. Section 3.2 shows forecast data for selected (approved) operations. No indicator achievements are reported in Section 3.2 because this data is only reported when operations are fully implemented and there were no fully implemented operations by the end of December 2016. However, data from partially implemented operations shows that delivery against the Programme's output indicators is beginning to come through as Operations submit claims and incur expenditure.

Progress made against the milestones and targets for the Performance Framework varies between Priorities. The milestones for Priority 1 was not forecast to be met at end 2016. However, the call for proposals in 2016, referred to in Section 3.1, aims to approve operations that will address the shortfall in the milestone and it is anticipated the milestone will be met by the end of 2018. Similarly, under Priorites 3 and 4 the

milestones are currently not forecast to be met. The milestones under Priority 2 are anticipated to be met by the end of 2018. A detailed examination of progress against indicator targets will take place in 2017, including those that contribute to the Performance Framework, and the findings will be presented to the Programme Monitoring Committee.

E-cohesion requires a system to allow the electronic transfer of data between beneficiaries and the Managing Authority. To manage Structural Funds WEFO uses an IT system called PPIMS, used by Managing Authority Officials. The externally facing system, used by beneficiaries to enter data, including everything from appraisal documentation to transaction lists and claims is called WEFO Online. Some minor developments were required during 2016, but by allowing the electronic transfer of data, WEFO Online meets the conditions of an Electronic Data Exchange System under the ecohesion requirements and therefore WEFO has been compliant with e-cohesion as of November 2015.

3. IMPLEMENTATION OF THE PRIORITY AXIS (ARTICLE 50(2) OF REGULATION (EU) NO 1303/2013)

3.1. Overview of the implementation

ID	Priority axis	Key information on the implementation of the priority axis with reference to key developments, significant problems and steps taken to address these problems
1	Research and Innovation	By end 2016 around 92% of the total allocation available had been committed to 7 operations under the Priority. Progress was made during 2016 with the majority of the key elements of the Priority now in place. The focus during the early part of the programming period has been to develop the strategic and backbone operations which will deliver key elements of the Priority; the aim of which is to support a step change in the knowledge economy in the Programme area. To build on this a call for innovative proposals that can successfully translate research and innovation into new and improved commercial products, processes and services was launched towards the end of 2016.
		The shift in the targeting approach for this Priority, compared with previous programmes, particularly affects the commercialisation part of the Priority. The call for proposals will look to address delivery of indicators in this area. The Programme aims to target more firms containing 10 or more employees and places more emphasis on those micro-businesses with genuine potential to grow to at least that size. This approach has the potential to have a greater economic impact but will mean less of a focus on volume of businesses supported. The indicators also reflect an emphasis on greater tailoring of more intensive support, looking at innovation systems as a whole within different businesses/clusters rather than numbers of innovations.
2	SME Competitiveness	By end 2016 over 97% of the total allocation available had been committed to 7 operations under the Priority. Progress was made during 2016 with the key elements of the Priority now in place. An integrated portfolio has been developed around operations that make up the 'Business Wales Family' encompassing Welsh Government, Wales Co-Operative Centre, Finance Wales and the Wales Council for Voluntary Action. The Wales Business Fund, a Financial Instrument, was launched in September 2016 and had already made good progress by the end of 2016, investing £4.0m in 10 SMEs . The ERDF is paid into the fund in tranches of 25% dependant on achieving investment targets and the operations under the Programme were ready to draw their second tranche of funding by the end of 2016.
		Forecast indicator data for most indicators are within the expected range for this time in the programming period. Exceptions are" number of enterprises" receiving grants, which reflects the greater emphasis placed on Financial Instruments.
		A review of indicators for this priority is being undertaken in 2016, and opportunities to address any significant gaps explored with the strategic operations.

ID	Priority axis	Key information on the implementation of the priority axis with reference to key developments, significant problems and steps taken to address these problems
3	Renewable Energy and Energy Efficiency	By end 2016 around 20% of the total allocation available had been committed to 1 operation under the Priority. The Priority will support small scale community renewable energy schemes and increasing the energy efficiency of existing Welsh housing stock, specifically targeting households facing severe fuel poverty. Workshops around the Programme area have taken place to raise the awareness of available funds for small scale community renewable energy schemes and a number of potential schemes are under consideration. There will also be a Community Energy call in the spring of 2017. With regard to energy efficiency in housing, the Arbed 3 strategic operation was approved during 2016. At this stage in the programming period it is too early to make any firm judgements on delivery against the indicator targets. Taking into account those operations under development, there are no immediate concerns about delivery. Given that the operations funded are capital builds, it is expected reporting on delivery will take place
		later on in the programming period.
4	Connectivity	By end 2016 over 24% of the total allocation available had been committed to 2 operations under the Priority, with the approval of the Superfast and Ultrafast broadband operations. The Programme concentrates on activities to support Broadband and the Cardiff Capital Region Metro.
		Progress continued to be made during 2016 on the development of the Metro Phase 2 operation which will complement the corresponding operation under the West Wales and the Valleys ERDF Programme which will be a Major Project . This may ultimately be packaged with the West Wales project.
		At this stage in the programming period it is too early to make any firm judgements on delivery against the indicator targets. From what has been approved and what is the pipeline, delivery appears to be on track.
5	Technical Assistance	By the end of 2016 over 82% of the total allocation available had been committed to 6 operations under the Priority. Progress was made during 2016 to complete approval of all of the Technical Assistance operations. This included the approval of four 'Regional Engagement Teams' based in North Wales, Mid Wales and South East Wales to help improve the management and delivery of the Programme, ensuring regional integration of delivery and by contributing to the move towards a more strategic delivery model with a clearer framework for economic prioritisation by ensuring regional alignment and coherence of operations. In addition, towards the end of 2016 the WEFO Technical Assistance operation under the Programme was also approved which will support the Managing Authority to help successfully manage the implementation of the Programme.

3.2. Common and programme specific indicators (Article 50(2) of Regulation (EU) No 1303/2013)

Priority axes other than technical assistance

Priority axis	1 - Research and Innovation
Investment Priority	1a - Enhancing research and innovation (R&I) infrastructure and capacities to develop R&I excellence, and promoting centres of competence, in particular those of European interest

Table 3A: Common and programme specific output indicators for the ERDF and the Cohesion Fund (by priority axis, investment priority, broken down by category of region for the ERDF)

(1)	ID	Indicator	Measurement unit	Category of region	Target value (2023) total	Target value (2023) men	Target value (2023) women	2016 Total	2016 Men	2016 Women	Observations
F	CO24	Research, innovation: Number of new researchers in supported entities	Full time equivalents	More developed	290.00			0.00			
S	CO24	Research, innovation: Number of new researchers in supported entities	Full time equivalents	More developed	290.00			91.00			
F	CO25	Research, Innovation: Number of researchers working in improved research infrastructure facilities	Full time equivalents	More developed	110.00			0.00			
S	CO25	Research, Innovation: Number of researchers working in improved research infrastructure facilities	Full time equivalents	More developed	110.00			61.00			
F	CO26	Research, Innovation: Number of enterprises cooperating with research institutions	Enterprises	More developed	90.00			0.00			
S	CO26	Research, Innovation: Number of enterprises cooperating with research institutions	Enterprises	More developed	90.00			31.00			
F	J2	Number of improved research infrastructure facilities	Number	More developed	2.00			0.00			
S	J2	Number of improved research infrastructure facilities	Number	More developed	2.00			1.00			
F	J3	Amount of research funding secured	GBP	More developed	65,000,000.00			0.00			
S	Ј3	Amount of research funding	GBP	More developed	65,000,000.00			28,097,996.00			

(1)	ID	Indicator	Measurement unit	Category of region	Target value (2023) total	Target value (2023) men	Target value (2023) women	2016 Total	2016 Men	2016 Women	Observations
		secured									

(1)	ID	Indicator	2015 Total	2015 Men	2015 Women	2014 Total	2014 Men	2014 Women
F	CO24	Research, innovation: Number of new researchers in supported entities	0.00			0.00		
S	CO24	Research, innovation: Number of new researchers in supported entities	59.00			0.00		
F	CO25	Research, Innovation: Number of researchers working in improved research infrastructure facilities	0.00			0.00		
S	CO25	Research, Innovation: Number of researchers working in improved research infrastructure facilities	61.00			0.00		
F	CO26	Research, Innovation: Number of enterprises cooperating with research institutions	0.00			0.00		
S	CO26	Research, Innovation: Number of enterprises cooperating with research institutions	126.00			0.00		
F	J2	Number of improved research infrastructure facilities	0.00			0.00		
S	J2	Number of improved research infrastructure facilities	1.00			0.00		
F	J3	Amount of research funding secured	0.00			0.00		
S	Ј3	Amount of research funding secured	28,097,986.00			0.00		

Priority axis	1 - Research and Innovation
Investment Priority	1a - Enhancing research and innovation (R&I) infrastructure and capacities to develop R&I excellence, and promoting centres of competence, in particular those of European interest
Specific objective	1.1 - To increase the success of Welsh research institutions in attracting competitive and private research funding.

ID	Indicator	Measurement unit	Category of region	Baseline value	Baseline year	Target value 2023	2016 Total	2016 Qualitative	Observations
1.1	Research income for Higher Education Institutions	GBP	More developed	92800000	2012	6% increase			2015 total: £113.4million. Data for 2015 and 2016 are calculated differently to previous years which makes comparisons over time difficult. Transitional changes for 2015 make this year atypical. Data for 2016 onwards should be consistent from that point onwards

ID	Indicator	2015 Total	2015 Qualitative	2014 Total	2014 Qualitative
1.1	Research income for Higher Education Institutions		113,400,000		

Priority axis	1 - Research and Innovation
Investment Priority	1b - Promoting business investment in R&I, developing links and synergies between enterprises, research and development centres and the higher education sector, in particular promoting investment in product and service development, technology transfer, social innovation, eco-innovation, public service applications, demand stimulation, networking, clusters and open innovation through smart specialisation, and supporting technological and applied research, pilot lines, early product validation actions, advanced manufacturing capabilities and first production, in particular in key enabling technologies and diffusion of general purpose technologies

Table 3A: Common and programme specific output indicators for the ERDF and the Cohesion Fund (by priority axis, investment priority, broken down by category of region for the ERDF)

(1)	ID	Indicator	Measurement unit	Category of region	Target value (2023) total	Target value (2023) men	Target value (2023) women	2016 Total	2016 Men	2016 Women	Observations
F	CO01	Productive investment: Number of enterprises receiving support	Enterprises	More developed	2,585.00			0.00			
S	CO01	Productive investment: Number of enterprises receiving support	Enterprises	More developed	2,585.00			770.00			
F	CO02	Productive investment: Number of enterprises receiving grants	Enterprises	More developed	320.00			0.00			
S	CO02	Productive investment: Number of enterprises receiving grants	Enterprises	More developed	320.00			305.00			
F	CO04	Productive investment: Number of enterprises receiving non-financial support	Enterprises	More developed	2,245.00			0.00			
S	CO04	Productive investment: Number of enterprises receiving non-financial support	Enterprises	More developed	2,245.00			459.00			
F	CO05	Productive investment: Number of new enterprises supported	Enterprises	More developed	20.00			0.00			
S	CO05	Productive investment: Number of new enterprises supported	Enterprises	More developed	20.00			6.00			
F	CO08	Productive investment: Employment increase in supported enterprises	Full time equivalents	More developed	670.00			0.00			
S	CO08	Productive investment: Employment increase in supported enterprises	Full time equivalents	More developed	670.00			186.00			
F	CO26	Research, Innovation: Number of enterprises cooperating with	Enterprises	More developed	715.00			0.00			

(1)	ID	Indicator	Measurement unit	Category of region	Target value (2023) total	Target value (2023) men	Target value (2023) women	2016 Total	2016 Men	2016 Women	Observations
		research institutions									
S	CO26	Research, Innovation: Number of enterprises cooperating with research institutions	Enterprises	More developed	715.00			211.00			
F	CO27	Research, Innovation: Private investment matching public support in innovation or R&D projects	EUR	More developed	26,160,000.00			0.00			
S	CO27	Research, Innovation: Private investment matching public support in innovation or R&D projects	EUR	More developed	26,160,000.00			27,540,200.00			
F	CO28	Research, Innovation: Number of enterprises supported to introduce new to the market products	Enterprises	More developed	300.00			0.00			
S	CO28	Research, Innovation: Number of enterprises supported to introduce new to the market products	Enterprises	More developed	300.00			91.00			
F	CO29	Research, Innovation: Number of enterprises supported to introduce new to the firm products	Enterprises	More developed	440.00			0.00			
S	CO29	Research, Innovation: Number of enterprises supported to introduce new to the firm products	Enterprises	More developed	440.00			141.00			
F	J4	Number of patents registered for products	Number	More developed	315.00			0.00			
S	J4	Number of patents registered for products	Number	More developed	315.00			87.00			
F	J5	Number of pilot projects completed	Number	More developed	0.00			0.00			
S	J5	Number of pilot projects completed	Number	More developed	0.00			0.00			
F	J6	Enterprises adopting or improving equality and diversity strategies and monitoring systems	Number	More developed	50.00			0.00			
S	J6	Enterprises adopting or improving equality and diversity	Number	More developed	50.00			0.00			

(1)	ID	Indicator	Measurement unit	Category of region	Target value (2023) total	Target value (2023) men	Target value (2023) women	2016 Total	2016 Men	2016 Women	Observations
		strategies and monitoring systems									
F	J7	Enterprises adopting or improving sustainable development strategies and monitoring systems	Number	More developed	50.00			0.00			
S	Ј7	Enterprises adopting or improving sustainable development strategies and monitoring systems	Number	More developed	50.00			0.00			

(1)	ID	Indicator	2015 Total	2015 Men	2015 Women	2014 Total	2014 Men	2014 Women
F	CO01	Productive investment: Number of enterprises receiving support	0.00			0.00		
S	CO01	Productive investment: Number of enterprises receiving support	740.00			0.00		
F	CO02	Productive investment: Number of enterprises receiving grants	0.00			0.00		
S	CO02	Productive investment: Number of enterprises receiving grants	305.00			0.00		
F	CO04	Productive investment: Number of enterprises receiving non-financial support	0.00			0.00		
S	CO04	Productive investment: Number of enterprises receiving non-financial support	435.00			0.00		
F	CO05	Productive investment: Number of new enterprises supported	0.00			0.00		
S	CO05	Productive investment: Number of new enterprises supported	0.00			0.00		
F	CO08	Productive investment: Employment increase in supported enterprises	0.00			0.00		
S	CO08	Productive investment: Employment increase in supported enterprises	136.00			0.00		
F	CO26	Research, Innovation: Number of enterprises cooperating with	0.00			0.00		

(1)	ID	Indicator	2015 Total	2015 Men	2015 Women	2014 Total	2014 Men	2014 Women
		research institutions						
S	CO26	Research, Innovation: Number of enterprises cooperating with research institutions	4.00			0.00		
F	CO27	Research, Innovation: Private investment matching public support in innovation or R&D projects	0.00			0.00		
S	CO27	Research, Innovation: Private investment matching public support in innovation or R&D projects	25,540,200.00			0.00		
F	CO28	Research, Innovation: Number of enterprises supported to introduce new to the market products	0.00			0.00		
S	CO28	Research, Innovation: Number of enterprises supported to introduce new to the market products	67.00			0.00		
F	CO29	Research, Innovation: Number of enterprises supported to introduce new to the firm products	0.00			0.00		
S	CO29	Research, Innovation: Number of enterprises supported to introduce new to the firm products	117.00			0.00		
F	J4	Number of patents registered for products	0.00			0.00		
S	J4	Number of patents registered for products	75.00			0.00		
F	J5	Number of pilot projects completed	0.00			0.00		
S	J5	Number of pilot projects completed	0.00			0.00		
F	J6	Enterprises adopting or improving equality and diversity strategies and monitoring systems	0.00			0.00		
S	J6	Enterprises adopting or improving equality and diversity strategies and monitoring	0.00			0.00		

(1)	ID	Indicator	2015 Total	2015 Men	2015 Women	2014 Total	2014 Men	2014 Women
		systems						
F	J7	Enterprises adopting or improving sustainable development strategies and monitoring systems	0.00			0.00		
S	J7	Enterprises adopting or improving sustainable development strategies and monitoring systems	0.00			0.00		

Priority axis	1 - Research and Innovation
Investment Priority	1b - Promoting business investment in R&I, developing links and synergies between enterprises, research and development centres and the higher education sector, in particular promoting investment in product and service development, technology transfer, social innovation, eco-innovation, public service applications, demand stimulation, networking, clusters and open innovation through smart specialisation, and supporting technological and applied research, pilot lines, early product validation actions, advanced manufacturing capabilities and first production, in particular in key enabling technologies and diffusion of general purpose technologies
Specific objective	1.2 - To increase the successful translation of research and innovation processes into new and improved commercial products, processes and services, in particular through improved technology transfer from HEIs.

ID	Indicator	Measurement unit	Category of region	Baseline value	Baseline year	Target value 2023	2016 Total	2016 Qualitative	Observations
1.3	Average share of total turnover from product innovation, and novel innovation: new to market, new to business and significantly improved	%	More developed	22.40	2010	23.00			Data for 2016 not yet available.

ID	Indicator	2015 Total	2015 Qualitative	2014 Total	2014 Qualitative
1.3	Average share of total turnover from product innovation, and novel innovation: new to market, new to business and significantly improved				

Priority axis	2 - SME Competitiveness
Investment Priority	1b - Promoting business investment in R&I, developing links and synergies between enterprises, research and development centres and the higher education sector, in particular promoting investment in product and service development, technology transfer, social innovation, eco-innovation, public service applications, demand stimulation, networking, clusters and open innovation through smart specialisation, and supporting technological and applied research, pilot lines, early product validation actions, advanced manufacturing capabilities and first production, in particular in key enabling technologies and diffusion of general purpose technologies

Table 3A: Common and programme specific output indicators for the ERDF and the Cohesion Fund (by priority axis, investment priority, broken down by category of region for the ERDF)

(1)	ID	Indicator	Measurement unit	Category of region	Target value (2023) total	Target value (2023) men	Target value (2023) women	2016 Total	2016 Men	2016 Women	Observations
F	CO01	Productive investment: Number of enterprises receiving support	Enterprises	More developed	25.00			0.00			
S	CO01	Productive investment: Number of enterprises receiving support	Enterprises	More developed	25.00			0.00			
F	CO03	Productive investment: Number of enterprises receiving financial support other than grants	Enterprises	More developed	25.00			0.00			
S	CO03	Productive investment: Number of enterprises receiving financial support other than grants	Enterprises	More developed	25.00			0.00			
F	CO07	Productive investment: Private investment matching public support to enterprises (nongrants)	EUR	More developed	14,100,000.00			0.00			
S	CO07	Productive investment: Private investment matching public support to enterprises (nongrants)	EUR	More developed	14,100,000.00			9,652,500.00			
F	CO08	Productive investment: Employment increase in supported enterprises	Full time equivalents	More developed	145.00			0.00			
S	CO08	Productive investment: Employment increase in supported enterprises	Full time equivalents	More developed	145.00			70.00			
F	CO29	Research, Innovation: Number of enterprises supported to introduce new to the firm	Enterprises	More developed	5.00			0.00			

(1)	ID	Indicator	Measurement unit	Category of region	Target value (2023) total	Target value (2023) men	Target value (2023) women	2016 Total	2016 Men	2016 Women	Observations
		products									
S	CO29	Research, Innovation: Number of enterprises supported to introduce new to the firm products	Enterprises	More developed	5.00			6.00			
F	J14	Invetsment in enterprises	GBP	More developed	7,819,774.00			0.00			
S	J14	Invetsment in enterprises	GBP	More developed	7,819,774.00			12,650,000.00			
F	J6	Enterprises adopting or improving equality and diversity strategies and monitoring systems	Number	More developed	13.00			0.00			
S	Ј6	Enterprises adopting or improving equality and diversity strategies and monitoring systems	Number	More developed	13.00			0.00			
F	J7	Enterprises adopting or improving sustainable development strategies and monitoring systems	Number	More developed	5.00			0.00			
S	J7	Enterprises adopting or improving sustainable development strategies and monitoring systems	Number	More developed	5.00			0.00			

(1)	ID	Indicator	2015 Total	2015 Men	2015 Women	2014 Total	2014 Men	2014 Women
F	CO01	Productive investment: Number of enterprises receiving support	0.00			0.00		
S	CO01	Productive investment: Number of enterprises receiving support	0.00			0.00		
F	CO03	Productive investment: Number of enterprises receiving financial support other than grants	0.00			0.00		
S	CO03	Productive investment: Number of enterprises receiving financial support other than grants	0.00			0.00		
F	CO07	Productive investment: Private investment matching public support to enterprises (nongrants)	0.00			0.00		

(1)	ID	Indicator	2015 Total	2015 Men	2015 Women	2014 Total	2014 Men	2014 Women
S	CO07	Productive investment: Private investment matching public support to enterprises (nongrants)	0.00			0.00		
F	CO08	Productive investment: Employment increase in supported enterprises	0.00			0.00		
S	CO08 Productive investment: Employment increase in supported enterprises		0.00			0.00		
F	CO29	Research, Innovation: Number of enterprises supported to introduce new to the firm products	0.00			0.00		
S	CO29	Research, Innovation: Number of enterprises supported to introduce new to the firm products	0.00			0.00		
F	J14	Invetsment in enterprises	0.00			0.00		
S	J14	Invetsment in enterprises	0.00			0.00		
F	J6	Enterprises adopting or improving equality and diversity strategies and monitoring systems	0.00			0.00		
S	J6	Enterprises adopting or improving equality and diversity strategies and monitoring systems	0.00			0.00		
F	J7	Enterprises adopting or improving sustainable development strategies and monitoring systems	0.00			0.00		
S	J7	Enterprises adopting or improving sustainable development strategies and monitoring systems	0.00			0.00		

Priority axis	2 - SME Competitiveness
Investment Priority	1b - Promoting business investment in R&I, developing links and synergies between enterprises, research and development centres and the higher education sector, in particular promoting investment in product and service development, technology transfer, social innovation, eco-innovation, public service applications, demand stimulation, networking, clusters and open innovation through smart specialisation, and supporting technological and applied research, pilot lines, early product validation actions, advanced manufacturing capabilities and first production, in particular in key enabling technologies and diffusion of general purpose technologies
Specific objective	2.5 - To address market failures in the availability of finance, in particular risk capital, for Welsh SMEs to undertake innovation and commercialise R&D.

ID	Indicator	Measurement unit	Category of region	Baseline value	Baseline year	Target value 2023	2016 Total	2016 Qualitative	Observations
2.5	Early stage equity investment	GBP	More developed	9000000	2012	£9.5m -£10m			Data not yet available for 2016.

ID	Indicator	2015 Total	2015 Qualitative	2014 Total	2014 Qualitative
2.5	Early stage equity investment		9,000,000		12,000,000

Priority axis	2 - SME Competitiveness
Investment Priority	3a - Promoting entrepreneurship, in particular by facilitating the economic exploitation of new ideas and fostering the creation of new firms, including through business incubators

Table 3A: Common and programme specific output indicators for the ERDF and the Cohesion Fund (by priority axis, investment priority, broken down by category of region for the ERDF)

(1)	ID	Indicator	Measurement unit	Category of region	Target value (2023) total	Target value (2023) men	Target value (2023) women	2016 Total	2016 Men	2016 Women	Observations
F	CO01	Productive investment: Number of enterprises receiving support	Enterprises	More developed	2,430.00			0.00			
S	CO01	Productive investment: Number of enterprises receiving support	Enterprises	More developed	2,430.00			4,031.00			
F	CO02	Productive investment: Number of enterprises receiving grants	Enterprises	More developed	45.00			0.00			
S	CO02	Productive investment: Number of enterprises receiving grants	Enterprises	More developed	45.00			0.00			
F	CO03	Productive investment: Number of enterprises receiving financial support other than grants	Enterprises	More developed	65.00			0.00			
S	CO03	Productive investment: Number of enterprises receiving financial support other than grants	Enterprises	More developed	65.00			31.00			
F	CO04	Productive investment: Number of enterprises receiving non-financial support	Enterprises	More developed	120.00			0.00			
S	CO04	Productive investment: Number of enterprises receiving non-financial support	Enterprises	More developed	120.00			0.00			
F	CO05	Productive investment: Number of new enterprises supported	Enterprises	More developed	2,200.00			0.00			
S	CO05	Productive investment: Number of new enterprises supported	Enterprises	More developed	2,200.00			4,000.00			
F	CO07	Productive investment: Private investment matching public support to enterprises (nongrants)	EUR	More developed	37,320,000.00			0.00			
S	CO07	Productive investment: Private	EUR	More developed	37,320,000.00			16,780,500.00			

(1)	ID	Indicator	Measurement unit	Category of region	Target value (2023) total	Target value (2023) men	Target value (2023) women	2016 Total	2016 Men	2016 Women	Observations
		investment matching public support to enterprises (non-grants)									
F	CO08	Productive investment: Employment increase in supported enterprises	Full time equivalents	More developed	4,450.00			0.00			
S	CO08	Productive investment: Employment increase in supported enterprises	Full time equivalents	More developed	4,450.00			7,015.00			
F	J10	Individuals receiving support - Female individuals	Number	More developed	3,100.00			0.00			
S	J10	Individuals receiving support - Female individuals	Number	More developed	3,100.00			0.00			
F	J11	Individuals receiving support - BME individuals	Number	More developed	445.00			0.00			
S	J11	Individuals receiving support - BME individuals	Number	More developed	445.00			0.00			
F	J12	Individuals receiving support - Disbaled individuals	Number	More developed	1,350.00			0.00			
S	J12	Individuals receiving support - Disbaled individuals	Number	More developed	1,350.00			0.00			
F	J14	Invetsment in enterprises	GBP	More developed	25,863,898.00			0.00			
S	J14	Invetsment in enterprises	GBP	More developed	25,863,898.00			22,330,000.00			
F	J6	Enterprises adopting or improving equality and diversity strategies and monitoring systems	Number	More developed	1,225.00			0.00			
S	J6	Enterprises adopting or improving equality and diversity strategies and monitoring systems	Number	More developed	1,225.00			1,000.00			
F	J7	Enterprises adopting or improving sustainable development strategies and monitoring systems	Number	More developed	490.00			0.00			
S	J7	Enterprises adopting or improving sustainable development strategies and monitoring systems	Number	More developed	490.00			1,000.00			
F	J9	Individuals recieving support	Number	More developed	6,200.00			0.00			

	(1)	ID	Indicator	Measurement unit	Category of region	Target value (2023) total	Target value (2023) men	Target value (2023) women	2016 Total	2016 Men	2016 Women	Observations
:	S	J9	Individuals recieving support	Number	More developed	6,200.00			4,000.00			

(1)	ID	Indicator	2015 Total	2015 Men	2015 Women	2014 Total	2014 Men	2014 Women
F	CO01	Productive investment: Number of enterprises receiving support	0.00			0.00		
S	CO01	Productive investment: Number of enterprises receiving support	4,000.00			0.00		
F	CO02	Productive investment: Number of enterprises receiving grants	0.00			0.00		
S	CO02	Productive investment: Number of enterprises receiving grants	0.00			0.00		
F	CO03 Productive investment: Number of enterprises receiving financial support other than grants				0.00			
S	CO03	Productive investment: Number of enterprises receiving financial support other than grants	0.00			0.00		
F	CO04	Productive investment: Number of enterprises receiving non-financial support	0.00			0.00		
S	CO04	Productive investment: Number of enterprises receiving non-financial support	0.00			0.00		
F	CO05	Productive investment: Number of new enterprises supported	0.00			0.00		
S	CO05	Productive investment: Number of new enterprises supported	4,000.00			0.00		
F	CO07	Productive investment: Private investment matching public support to enterprises (nongrants)	0.00			0.00		
S	CO07	Productive investment: Private investment matching public support to enterprises (nongrants)	0.00			0.00		
F	CO08	Productive investment: Employment increase in supported enterprises	0.00			0.00		

(1)	ID	Indicator	2015 Total	2015 Men	2015 Women	2014 Total	2014 Men	2014 Women
S	CO08	Productive investment: Employment increase in supported enterprises	6,750.00			0.00		
F	J10	Individuals receiving support - 0.00						
S	J10	Individuals receiving support - Female individuals	0.00			0.00		
F	J11	BME individuals				0.00		
S	J11	BME individuals						
F	J12	Individuals receiving support - Disbaled individuals	0.00			0.00		
S	J12	Individuals receiving support - Disbaled individuals	0.00			0.00		
F	J14	Invetsment in enterprises	0.00			0.00		
S	J14	Invetsment in enterprises	0.00			0.00		
F	J6	Enterprises adopting or improving equality and diversity strategies and monitoring systems	0.00			0.00		
S	J6	Enterprises adopting or improving equality and diversity strategies and monitoring systems	1,000.00			0.00		
F	J7	Enterprises adopting or improving sustainable development strategies and monitoring systems	0.00			0.00		
S	J7	Enterprises adopting or improving sustainable development strategies and monitoring systems	1,000.00			0.00		
F	Ј9	Individuals recieving support	0.00			0.00		
S	Ј9	Individuals recieving support	45,000.00			0.00		

Priority axis	2 - SME Competitiveness
Investment Priority	3a - Promoting entrepreneurship, in particular by facilitating the economic exploitation of new ideas and fostering the creation of new firms, including through business incubators
Specific objective	2.1 - To increase the amount of finance available to SMEs for both business start-up and for business expansion.

ID	Indicator	Measurement unit	Category of region	Baseline value	Baseline year	Target value 2023	2016 Total	2016 Qualitative	Observations
2.1	Amount invested in Venture Capital and Expansion Capital	GBP	More developed	18m	2012	19m-20m			Data not yet available for 2016.

ID	Indicator	2015 Total	2015 Qualitative	2014 Total	2014 Qualitative
2.1	Amount invested in Venture Capital and Expansion Capital		16,000,000		28,000,000

Priority axis	2 - SME Competitiveness
Investment Priority	3a - Promoting entrepreneurship, in particular by facilitating the economic exploitation of new ideas and fostering the creation of new firms, including through business incubators
Specific objective	2.2 - To increase the number of SME start-ups through the provision of information, advice and guidance and support for entrepreneurship.

ID	Indicator	Measurement unit	Category of region	Baseline value	Baseline year	Target value 2023	2016 Total	2016 Qualitative	Observations
2.2	Count of birth of new enterprises	Number	More developed	3595	2012	5% increase in annual rate			Data not yet available for 2016.

ID	Indicator	2015 Total	2015 Qualitative	2014 Total	2014 Qualitative
2.2	Count of birth of new enterprises		4,965		4,935

Priority axis	2 - SME Competitiveness
Investment Priority	3d - Supporting the capacity of SMEs to grow in regional, national and international markets, and to engage in innovation processes

Table 3A: Common and programme specific output indicators for the ERDF and the Cohesion Fund (by priority axis, investment priority, broken down by category of region for the ERDF)

(1)	ID	Indicator	Measurement unit	Category of region	Target value (2023) total	Target value (2023) men	Target value (2023) women	2016 Total	2016 Men	2016 Women	Observations
F	CO01	Productive investment: Number of enterprises receiving support	Enterprises	More developed	6,425.00			0.00			
S	CO01	Productive investment: Number of enterprises receiving support	Enterprises	More developed	6,425.00			9,279.00			
F	CO02	Productive investment: Number of enterprises receiving grants	Enterprises	More developed	10.00			0.00			
S	CO02	Productive investment: Number of enterprises receiving grants	Enterprises	More developed	10.00			15.00			
F	CO03	Productive investment: Number of enterprises receiving financial support other than grants	Enterprises	More developed	115.00			0.00			
S	CO03	Productive investment: Number of enterprises receiving financial support other than grants	Enterprises	More developed	115.00			0.00			
F	CO04	Productive investment: Number of enterprises receiving non-financial support	Enterprises	More developed	6,300.00			0.00			
S	CO04	Productive investment: Number of enterprises receiving non-financial support	Enterprises	More developed	6,300.00			9,264.00			
F	CO06	Productive investment: Private investment matching public support to enterprises (grants)	EUR	More developed	2,220,000.00			0.00			
S	CO06	Productive investment: Private investment matching public support to enterprises (grants)	EUR	More developed	2,220,000.00			300,000.00			
F	CO07	Productive investment: Private investment matching public support to enterprises (nongrants)	EUR	More developed	3,360,000.00			0.00			

(1)	ID	Indicator	Measurement unit	Category of region	Target value (2023) total	Target value (2023) men	Target value (2023) women	2016 Total	2016 Men	2016 Women	Observations
S	CO07	Productive investment: Private investment matching public support to enterprises (nongrants)	EUR	More developed	3,360,000.00			0.00			
F	CO08	Productive investment: Employment increase in supported enterprises	Full time equivalents	More developed	2,550.00			0.00			
S	CO08	Productive investment: Employment increase in supported enterprises	Full time equivalents	More developed	2,550.00			4,606.00			
F	CO29	Research, Innovation: Number of enterprises supported to introduce new to the firm products	Enterprises	More developed	400.00			0.00			
S	CO29	Research, Innovation: Number of enterprises supported to introduce new to the firm products	Enterprises	More developed	400.00			400.00			
F	J15	Increase in level of export	GBP	More developed	65,900,000.00			0.00			
S	J15	Increase in level of export	GBP	More developed	65,900,000.00			85,000,000.00			
F	J6	Enterprises adopting or improving equality and diversity strategies and monitoring systems	Number	More developed	3,200.00			0.00			
S	J6	Enterprises adopting or improving equality and diversity strategies and monitoring systems	Number	More developed	3,200.00			3,300.00			
F	J7	Enterprises adopting or improving sustainable development strategies and monitoring systems	Number	More developed	1,300.00			0.00			
S	J7	Enterprises adopting or improving sustainable development strategies and monitoring systems	Number	More developed	1,300.00			3,300.00			

(1)	ID	Indicator	2015 Total	2015 Men	2015 Women	2014 Total	2014 Men	2014 Women
F	CO01	Productive investment: Number	0.00			0.00		

(1)	ID	Indicator	2015 Total	2015 Men	2015 Women	2014 Total	2014 Men	2014 Women
		of enterprises receiving support						
S	CO01	Productive investment: Number of enterprises receiving support	9,264.00			0.00		
F	CO02	Productive investment: Number of enterprises receiving grants	0.00			0.00		
S	CO02	Productive investment: Number of enterprises receiving grants	0.00			0.00		
F	CO03	Productive investment: Number of enterprises receiving financial support other than grants	0.00			0.00		
S	CO03	Productive investment: Number of enterprises receiving financial support other than grants	0.00			0.00		
F	CO04 Productive investment: Number of enterprises receiving non-financial support		0.00			0.00		
S	CO04	Productive investment: Number of enterprises receiving non-financial support	9,264.00			0.00		
F	CO06	Productive investment: Private investment matching public support to enterprises (grants)	0.00			0.00		
S	CO06	Productive investment: Private investment matching public support to enterprises (grants)	0.00			0.00		
F	CO07	Productive investment: Private investment matching public support to enterprises (nongrants)	0.00			0.00		
S	CO07	Productive investment: Private investment matching public support to enterprises (nongrants)	0.00			0.00		
F	CO08	Productive investment: Employment increase in supported enterprises	0.00			0.00		
S	CO08	Productive investment: Employment increase in supported enterprises	4,600.00			0.00		
F	CO29	Research, Innovation: Number of enterprises supported to introduce new to the firm	0.00			0.00		

(1)	ID	Indicator	2015 Total	2015 Men	2015 Women	2014 Total	2014 Men	2014 Women
		products						
S	CO29	Research, Innovation: Number of enterprises supported to introduce new to the firm products	400.00			0.00		
F	J15	Increase in level of export	0.00			0.00		
S	J15	Increase in level of export	85,000,000.00			0.00		
F	J6	Enterprises adopting or improving equality and diversity strategies and monitoring systems	0.00			0.00		
S	J6	Enterprises adopting or improving equality and diversity strategies and monitoring systems	3,300.00			0.00		
F	J7	Enterprises adopting or improving sustainable development strategies and monitoring systems	0.00			0.00		
S	J7	Enterprises adopting or improving sustainable development strategies and monitoring systems	3,300.00			0.00		

Priority axis	2 - SME Competitiveness
Investment Priority	3d - Supporting the capacity of SMEs to grow in regional, national and international markets, and to engage in innovation processes
Specific objective	2.3 - To increase the take-up and exploitation of NGA networks and ICT infrastructure by SMEs

ID	Indicator	Measurement unit	Category of region	Baseline value	Baseline year	Target value 2023	2016 Total	2016 Qualitative	Observations
2.3	SME use of fibre and cable broadband	% of SMEs	More developed	22%	2013	27%			Currently unable to access data for this indicator. Exploring options with Ofcom Wales, the data provider.

ID	Indicator	2015 Total	2015 Qualitative	2014 Total	2014 Qualitative
2.3	SME use of fibre and cable broadband				22%

Priority axis	2 - SME Competitiveness
Investment Priority	3d - Supporting the capacity of SMEs to grow in regional, national and international markets, and to engage in innovation processes
Specific objective	2.4 - To increase the growth of those SMEs with growth potential, in particular through accessing new markets (both domestic and international)

ID	Indicator	Measurement unit	Category of region	Baseline value	Baseline year	Target value 2023	2016 Total	2016 Qualitative	Observations
2.4	Employment within small (10-49 employees) and medium (50-249) SMEs	Percent	More developed	117100	2013	6% increase		124,600	

ID	Indicator	2015 Total	2015 Qualitative	2014 Total	2014 Qualitative
2.4	Employment within small (10-49 employees) and medium (50-249) SMEs		122,500		119,600

Priority axis	3 - Renewable Energy and Energy Efficiency
Investment Priority	4a - Promoting the production and distribution of energy derived from renewable sources

Table 3A: Common and programme specific output indicators for the ERDF and the Cohesion Fund (by priority axis, investment priority, broken down by category of region for the ERDF)

(1)	ID	Indicator	Measurement unit	Category of region	Target value (2023) total	Target value (2023) men	Target value (2023) women	2016 Total	2016 Men	2016 Women	Observations
F	CO01	Productive investment: Number of enterprises receiving support	Enterprises	More developed	70.00			0.00			
S	CO01	Productive investment: Number of enterprises receiving support	Enterprises	More developed	70.00			0.00			
F	CO04	Productive investment: Number of enterprises receiving non-financial support	Enterprises	More developed	70.00			0.00			
S	CO04	Productive investment: Number of enterprises receiving non-financial support	Enterprises	More developed	70.00			0.00			
F	CO29	Research, Innovation: Number of enterprises supported to introduce new to the firm products	Enterprises	More developed	35.00			0.00			
S	CO29	Research, Innovation: Number of enterprises supported to introduce new to the firm products	Enterprises	More developed	35.00			0.00			
F	CO30	Renewables: Additional capacity of renewable energy production	MW	More developed	8.00			0.00			
S	CO30	Renewables: Additional capacity of renewable energy production	MW	More developed	8.00			0.00			
F	J16	Community Energy Schemes	Number	More developed	3.00			0.00			
S	J16	Community Energy Schemes	Number	More developed	3.00			0.00			
F	J17	Energy support site preparation schemes	Number	More developed	1.00			0.00			
S	J17	Energy support site preparation schemes	Number	More developed	1.00			0.00			
F	J18	Number of renewable energy	Number	More developed	3.00			0.00			

(1)	ID	Indicator	Measurement unit	Category of region	Target value (2023) total	Target value (2023) men	Target value (2023) women	2016 Total	2016 Men	2016 Women	Observations
		prototypes tested									
S		Number of renewable energy prototypes tested	Number	More developed	3.00			0.00			
F		Number of pilot projects completed	Number	More developed	3.00			0.00			
S	J5	Number of pilot projects completed	Number	More developed	3.00			0.00			

(1)	ID	Indicator	2015 Total	2015 Men	2015 Women	2014 Total	2014 Men	2014 Women
F	CO01	Productive investment: Number of enterprises receiving support	0.00			0.00		
S	CO01	Productive investment: Number of enterprises receiving support	0.00			0.00		
F	CO04	Productive investment: Number of enterprises receiving non-financial support	0.00			0.00		
S	CO04	Productive investment: Number of enterprises receiving non-financial support	0.00			0.00		
F	CO29	Research, Innovation: Number of enterprises supported to introduce new to the firm products	0.00			0.00		
S	CO29	Research, Innovation: Number of enterprises supported to introduce new to the firm products	0.00			0.00		
F	CO30	Renewables: Additional capacity of renewable energy production	0.00			0.00		
S	CO30	Renewables: Additional capacity of renewable energy production	0.00			0.00		
F	J16	Community Energy Schemes	0.00			0.00		
S	J16	Community Energy Schemes	0.00			0.00		
F	J17	Energy support site preparation schemes	0.00			0.00		
S	J17	Energy support site preparation schemes	0.00			0.00		

(1)	ID	Indicator	2015 Total	2015 Men	2015 Women	2014 Total	2014 Men	2014 Women
F	J18	Number of renewable energy prototypes tested	0.00			0.00		
S	J18	Number of renewable energy prototypes tested	0.00			0.00		
F	J5	Number of pilot projects completed	0.00			0.00		
S	J5	Number of pilot projects completed	0.00			0.00		

Priority axis	3 - Renewable Energy and Energy Efficiency
Investment Priority	4a - Promoting the production and distribution of energy derived from renewable sources
Specific objective	3.1 - To increase the number of small scale renewable energy schemes established.

ID	Indicator	Measurement unit	Category of region	Baseline value	Baseline year	Target value 2023	2016 Total	2016 Qualitative	Observations
3.1	Number of sites generating electricity from renewable sources (excluding PV)	Number	More developed	493	2012	3-6 Aditional sites			Data for 2016 not yet available.

ID	Indicator	2015 Total	2015 Qualitative	2014 Total	2014 Qualitative
3.1	Number of sites generating electricity from renewable sources (excluding PV)		812		

Priority axis	3 - Renewable Energy and Energy Efficiency
Investment Priority	4c - Supporting energy efficiency, smart energy management and renewable energy use in public infrastructure, including in public buildings, and in the housing sector

Table 3A: Common and programme specific output indicators for the ERDF and the Cohesion Fund (by priority axis, investment priority, broken down by category of region for the ERDF)

(1)	ID	Indicator	Measurement unit	Category of region	Target value (2023) total	Target value (2023) men	Target value (2023) women	2016 Total	2016 Men	2016 Women	Observations
F	CO31	Energy efficiency: Number of households with improved energy consumption classification	Households	More developed	4,200.00			0.00			
S	CO31	Energy efficiency: Number of households with improved energy consumption classification	Households	More developed	4,200.00			0.00			
F	CO34	GHG reduction: Estimated annual decrease of GHG	Tonnes of CO2eq	More developed	5.00			0.00			
S	CO34	GHG reduction: Estimated annual decrease of GHG	Tonnes of CO2eq	More developed	5.00			0.00			

(1)	ID	Indicator	2015 Total	2015 Men	2015 Women	2014 Total	2014 Men	2014 Women
F	CO31	Energy efficiency: Number of households with improved energy consumption classification	0.00			0.00		
S	CO31	Energy efficiency: Number of households with improved energy consumption classification	0.00			0.00		
F	CO34	GHG reduction: Estimated annual decrease of GHG	0.00			0.00		
S	CO34	GHG reduction: Estimated annual decrease of GHG	0.00			0.00		

Priority axis	3 - Renewable Energy and Energy Efficiency						
Investment Priority	4c - Supporting energy efficiency, smart energy management and renewable energy use in public infrastructure, including in public buildings, and in the housing sector						
Specific objective	3.2 - To increase the energy efficiency of the existing Welsh housing stock, particularly in areas of fuel poverty						

ID	Indicator	Measurement unit	Category of region	Baseline value	Baseline year	Target value 2023	2016 Total	2016 Qualitative	Observations
3.2	Energy efficincy rating of households facing severe fuel poverty	EPC rating	More developed	61,000	2010	Increase energy performance by 2 ratings for 10% of baseline			Intervention not yet started.

ID	Indicator	2015 Total	2015 Qualitative	2014 Total	2014 Qualitative
3.2	Energy efficincy rating of households facing severe fuel poverty				

Priority axis	4 - Connectivity
Investment Priority	2a - Extending broadband deployment and the roll-out of high-speed networks and supporting the adoption of emerging technologies and networks for the digital economy

Table 3A: Common and programme specific output indicators for the ERDF and the Cohesion Fund (by priority axis, investment priority, broken down by category of region for the ERDF)

(1)	ID	Indicator	Measurement unit	Category of region	Target value (2023) total	Target value (2023) men	Target value (2023) women	2016 Total	2016 Men	2016 Women	Observations
F	CO10	ICT Infrastructure: Additional households with broadband access of at least 30 Mbps	Households	More developed	28,000.00			0.00			
S	CO10	ICT Infrastructure: Additional households with broadband access of at least 30 Mbps	Households	More developed	28,000.00			46,801.00			
F	J28	Number of Enterprises supported to connect to 100Mbps or higher networks	Number	Less developed	25.00			0.00			
S	J28	Number of Enterprises supported to connect to 100Mbps or higher networks	Number	Less developed	25.00			25.00			
F	J29	Additional population covered by ultrafast broadband (>100Mbps) broadband	Number	More developed	0.00			0.00			
S	J29	Additional population covered by ultrafast broadband (>100Mbps) broadband	Number	More developed	0.00			43,494.00			

(1) S=Selected operations, F=Fully implemented operations

(1)	ID	Indicator	2015 Total	2015 Men	2015 Women	2014 Total	2014 Men	2014 Women
F	CO10	ICT Infrastructure: Additional households with broadband access of at least 30 Mbps	0.00			0.00		
S	CO10	ICT Infrastructure: Additional households with broadband access of at least 30 Mbps	0.00			0.00		
F	J28	Number of Enterprises supported	0.00			0.00		

(1)	ID	Indicator	2015 Total	2015 Men	2015 Women	2014 Total	2014 Men	2014 Women
		to connect to 100Mbps or higher networks						
S	J28	Number of Enterprises supported to connect to 100Mbps or higher networks	0.00			0.00		
F	J29	Additional population covered by ultrafast broadband (>100Mbps) broadband	0.00			0.00		
S	J29	Additional population covered by ultrafast broadband (>100Mbps) broadband	0.00			0.00		

Priority axis	4 - Connectivity
Investment Priority	2a - Extending broadband deployment and the roll-out of high-speed networks and supporting the adoption of emerging technologies and networks for the digital economy
Specific objective	4.2 - To contribute to Digital Agenda for Europe targets in Wales for 100% access to next generation broadband (30Mbps and above) and 50% access to 100Mbps

ID	Indicator	Measurement unit	Category of region	Baseline value	Baseline year	Target value 2023	2016 Total	2016 Qualitative	Observations
4.2	Proportion of premises that are in postcodes served by NGA networks	percentage	More developed	58%	2013	65%		85%	Indicator has changed for 2016 so is not comparable with previous years. See Section 11.1 for discussion.

ID	Indicator	2015 Total	2015 Qualitative	2014 Total	2014 Qualitative
4.2	Proportion of premises that are in postcodes served by NGA networks		87%		58%

Priority axis	4 - Connectivity
Investment Priority	4e - Promoting low-carbon strategies for all types of territories, in particular for urban areas, including the promotion of sustainable multimodal urban mobility and mitigation-relevant adaptation measures

Table 3A: Common and programme specific output indicators for the ERDF and the Cohesion Fund (by priority axis, investment priority, broken down by category of region for the ERDF)

(1)	ID	Indicator	Measurement unit	Category of region	Target value (2023) total	Target value (2023) men	Target value (2023) women	2016 Total	2016 Men	2016 Women	Observations
F	CO12	Railway: Total length of reconstructed or upgraded railway line	km	More developed	3.00			0.00			
S	CO12	Railway: Total length of reconstructed or upgraded railway line	km	More developed	3.00			0.00			
F	CO15	Urban transport: Total length of new or improved tram and metro lines	km	More developed	5.00			0.00			
S	CO15	Urban transport: Total length of new or improved tram and metro lines	km	More developed	5.00			0.00			
F	CO2	Reduction in CO2 equivalent emissions	tCO2e	More developed	1,800.00			0.00			
S	CO2	Reduction in CO2 equivalent emissions	tCO2e	More developed	1,800.00			0.00			
F	J19	Public transport services created or improved	Vehicle Km	More developed	420,000.00			0.00			
S	J19	Public transport services created or improved	Vehicle Km	More developed	420,000.00			0.00			
F	J20	Intermodal facilities created or improved	Number	More developed	5.00			0.00			
S	J20	Intermodal facilities created or improved	Number	More developed	5.00			0.00			
F	J22	Gross passenger kilometres on public trnsport	passenger km	More developed	67,200,000.00			0.00			
S	J22	Gross passenger kilometres on public trnsport	passenger km	More developed	67,200,000.00			0.00			

(1) S=Selected operations, F=Fully implemented operations

(1)	ID	Indicator	2015 Total	2015 Men	2015 Women	2014 Total	2014 Men	2014 Women
F	CO12	Railway: Total length of reconstructed or upgraded railway line	0.00			0.00		
S	CO12	Railway: Total length of reconstructed or upgraded railway line	0.00			0.00		
F	CO15	Urban transport: Total length of new or improved tram and metro lines	0.00			0.00		
S	CO15	Urban transport: Total length of new or improved tram and metro lines	0.00			0.00		
F	CO2	Reduction in CO2 equivalent emissions	0.00			0.00		
S	CO2	Reduction in CO2 equivalent emissions	0.00			0.00		
F	J19	Public transport services created or improved	0.00			0.00		
S	J19	Public transport services created or improved	0.00			0.00		
F	J20	Intermodal facilities created or improved	0.00			0.00		
S	J20	Intermodal facilities created or improved	0.00			0.00		
F	J22	Gross passenger kilometres on public trnsport	0.00			0.00		
S	J22	Gross passenger kilometres on public trnsport	0.00			0.00		

Priority axis	4 - Connectivity
Investment Priority	4e - Promoting low-carbon strategies for all types of territories, in particular for urban areas, including the promotion of sustainable multimodal urban mobility and mitigation-relevant adaptation measures
Specific objective	4.1 - To increase urban and labour mobility to and from key urban and employment centres

ID	Indicator	Measurement unit	Category of region	Baseline value	Baseline year	Target value 2023	2016 Total	2016 Qualitative	Observations
4.1	Total passengers using public transport between key urban links	Number	More developed	869,000	2013	10% increase in passengers for selected baseline			Data available on request only. As activity not sufficiently advanced WEFO has not yet asked for an update.

ID	Indicator	2015 Total	2015 Qualitative	2014 Total	2014 Qualitative
4.1	Total passengers using public transport between key urban links				

Priority axes for technical assistance

Table 3A: Common and programme specific output indicators for the ERDF and the Cohesion Fund (by priority axis, investment priority, broken down by category of region for the ERDF)

(1)	ID	Indicator	Measurement unit	Category of region	Target value (2023) total	Target value (2023) men	Target value (2023) women	2016 Total	2016 Men	2016 Women	Observations
F	TA13	Employees FTEs (full time equivalents) whose salaries are co-financed by TA	Number					0.00			
S	TA13	Employees FTEs (full time equivalents) whose salaries are co-financed by TA	Number					16.00			
F	TAO1	Number of training events held	Number		10.00			0.00			
S	TAO1	Number of training events held	Number		10.00			7.00			
F	TAO10	Number of e-newsletters issued	Number		72.00			0.00			
S	TAO10	Number of e-newsletters issued	Number		72.00			29.00			
F	TAO11	Percentage of enquiries resolved within 5 working days	Percentage		75.00			0.00			
S	TAO11	Percentage of enquiries resolved within 5 working days	Percentage		75.00			75.00			
F	TAO12	Number of audit visits	Number		50.00			0.00			
S	TAO12	Number of audit visits	Number		50.00			24.00			
F	TAO2	Framework Contract for Specialist Expertise in place for project delivery	Number		1.00			0.00			
S	TAO2	Framework Contract for Specialist Expertise in place for project delivery	Number		1.00			0.00			
F	TAO3	Number of projects undergoing a formal assessment for their cross cutting themes integration	Number		90.00			0.00			
S	TAO3	Number of projects undergoing a formal assessment for their cross cutting themes integration	Number		90.00			24.00			

(1)	ID	Indicator	Measurement unit	Category of region	Target value (2023) total	Target value (2023) men	Target value (2023) women	2016 Total	2016 Men	2016 Women	Observations
F	TAO4	Number of research reports published	Number		34.00			0.00			
S	TAO4	Number of research reports published	Number		34.00			15.00			
F	TAO5	Number of projects given Monitoring and Evaluation advice	Number		100.00			0.00			
S	TAO5	Number of projects given Monitoring and Evaluation advice	Number		100.00			24.00			
F	TAO6	Number of dissemination events	Number		6.00			0.00			
S	TAO6	Number of dissemination events	Number		6.00			11.00			
F	TAO7	Number of events organised by WEFO	Number		10.00			0.00			
S	TAO7	Number of events organised by WEFO	Number		10.00			0.00			
F	TAO8	Number of press releases issued	Number		400.00			0.00			
S	TAO8	Number of press releases issued	Number		400.00			47.00			
F	TAO9	Number of high profile project launches	Number		50.00			0.00			
S	TAO9	Number of high profile project launches	Number		50.00			23.00			

(1) S=Selected operations, F=Fully implemented operations

(1)	ID	Indicator	2015 Total	2015 Men	2015 Women	2014 Total	2014 Men	2014 Women
F	TA13	Employees FTEs (full time equivalents) whose salaries are co-financed by TA	0.00			0.00		
S	TA13	Employees FTEs (full time equivalents) whose salaries are co-financed by TA	0.00			0.00		
F	TAO1	Number of training events held	0.00			0.00		
S	TAO1	Number of training events held	0.00			0.00		
F	TAO10	Number of e-newsletters issued	0.00			0.00		
S	TAO10	Number of e-newsletters issued	0.00			0.00		

(1)	ID	Indicator	2015 Total	2015 Men	2015 Women	2014 Total	2014 Men	2014 Women
F	TAO11	Percentage of enquiries resolved within 5 working days	0.00			0.00		
S	TAO11	Percentage of enquiries resolved within 5 working days	0.00			0.00		
F	TAO12	Number of audit visits	0.00			0.00		
S	TAO12	Number of audit visits	0.00			0.00		
F	TAO2	Framework Contract for Specialist Expertise in place for project delivery	0.00			0.00		
S	TAO2	Framework Contract for Specialist Expertise in place for project delivery	0.00			0.00		
F	TAO3	Number of projects undergoing a formal assessment for their cross cutting themes integration	0.00		0.00			
S	TAO3	Number of projects undergoing a formal assessment for their cross cutting themes integration	0.00			0.00		
F	TAO4	Number of research reports published	0.00			0.00		
S	TAO4	Number of research reports published	2.00			0.00		
F	TAO5	Number of projects given Monitoring and Evaluation advice	0.00			0.00		
S	TAO5	Number of projects given Monitoring and Evaluation advice	0.00			0.00		
F	TAO6	Number of dissemination events	0.00			0.00		
S	TAO6	Number of dissemination events	0.00		_	0.00		
F	TAO7	Number of events organised by WEFO	0.00			0.00		
S	TAO7	Number of events organised by WEFO	0.00			0.00		
F	TAO8	Number of press releases issued	0.00			0.00		
S	TAO8	Number of press releases issued	0.00			0.00		
F	TAO9	Number of high profile project launches	0.00			0.00		

(1)	ID	Indicator	2015 Total	2015 Men	2015 Women	2014 Total	2014 Men	2014 Women
S	TAO9	Number of high profile project launches	0.00			0.00		

Priority axis	5 - Technical Assistance
Specific objective	5.1 - To ensure the efficient and effective management of the 2014-2020 programmes.

ID	Indicator	Measurement unit	Category of region	Baseline value	Baseline year	Target value 2023	2016 Total	2016 Qualitative	Observations
TAR1	Irregularity rate	percentage		0.53	2013	Below 2%		0.25	
TAR2	WEFO Error Rate	percentage		0.67	2012	Below 2%			There is no error rate to report yet as no Audit Authority visit had taken place by the end of 2016.

ID	Indicator	2015 Total	2015 Qualitative	2014 Total	2014 Qualitative
TAR1	Irregularity rate				
TAR2	WEFO Error Rate				

Priority axis	5 - Technical Assistance
Specific objective	5.2 - To provide high quality advice to key partners involved in the design and delivery of operations

ID	Indicator	Measurement unit	Category of region	Baseline value	Baseline year	Target value 2023	2016 Total	2016 Qualitative	Observations
TAR3	Customer satisfaction	percentage		45	2009	50			No customer satisfaction research undertaken to date.

ID	Indicator	2015 Total	2015 Qualitative	2014 Total	2014 Qualitative
TAR3	Customer satisfaction				

Priority axis	5 - Technical Assistance
Specific objective	5.3 - To enhance the integration and the complementarity of investments with other ESI funds and wider Commission led and Sector based
	programmes.

ID	Indicator	Measurement unit	Category of region	Baseline value	Baseline year	Target value 2023	2016 Total	2016 Qualitative	Observations
TAR3	Customer satisfaction	percentage		45	2009	50			No customer satisfaction research undertaken to date.

ID	Indicator	2015 Total	2015 Qualitative	2014 Total	2014 Qualitative
TAR3	Customer satisfaction				

Table 3B: Number of enterprises supported by the operational programme net of multiple support to the same enterprises

Indicator	Number of enterprises supported by OP net of multiple support
CO01 - Productive investment: Number of enterprises receiving support	0
CO02 - Productive investment: Number of enterprises receiving grants	0
CO03 - Productive investment: Number of enterprises receiving financial support other than grants	0
CO04 - Productive investment: Number of enterprises receiving non-financial support	0
CO05 - Productive investment: Number of new enterprises supported	0

Table 5: Information on the milestones and targets defined in the performance framework

	Ind type	ID	Indicator	Measurement unit	Fund	Category of region	2016 Cum total	2016 Cum men	2016 Cum women	2016 Annual total	2016 Annual total men	2016 Annual total women
1	F	12	Total amount of eligible expenditure entered into the accounting system of the certifying authority and certified by the authority	€	ERDF	More developed	19,138,466.89					
1	I	12	% of final target for 'number of enterprises receiving non-financial support' which has been achieved by partially completed and fully completed operations	%	ERDF	More developed	1.00					
1	О	CO04	Productive investment: Number of enterprises receiving non- financial support	Enterprises	ERDF	More developed	0.00					
2	F	12	Total amount of eligible expenditure entered into the accounting system of the certifying authority and certified by the authority	€	ERDF	More developed	26,822,390.99					
2	I		% of final target for number of enterprises receiving non- financial support that has been achieved by partially completed and fully completed operations	%	ERDF	More developed	10.00					
2	0	CO04	Productive investment: Number of enterprises receiving non- financial support	Enterprises	ERDF	More developed	0.00					
3	F	12	Total amount of eligible expenditure entered into the accounting system of the certifying authority and certified by the authority	ϵ	ERDF	More developed	0.00					
3	I	I4	% of final target for householder with improved energy consumption classification has been achieved by partially completed and fully completed operations	%	ERDF	More developed	0.00					

	Ind type	ID		Measurement unit	Fund	Category of region	2016 Cum total	2016 Cum men	2016 Cum women	2016 Annual total	2016 Annual total men	2016 Annual total women
3	0		Energy efficiency: Number of households with improved energy consumption classification	Households	ERDF	More developed	0.00					
4	F		Total amount of eligible expenditure entered into the accounting system of the certifying authority and certified by the authority		ERDF	More developed	0.00					
4	I		X% of the priority financial allocation accounted by contractural agreements to deliver infrastructure works		ERDF	More developed	29.00					
4	О		Gross passenger kilometres on public trnsport	passenger km	ERDF	More developed	0.00					

Priority axis	Ind type	ID	Indicator	Measurement unit	Fund	Category of region	2015 Cum total	2014 Cum total	Observations
1	F	12	Total amount of eligible expenditure entered into the accounting system of the certifying authority and certified by the authority	€	ERDF	More developed	0.00	0.00	
1	I		% of final target for 'number of enterprises receiving non-financial support' which has been achieved by partially completed and fully completed operations	%	ERDF	More developed	0.00	0.00	
1	О	CO04	Productive investment: Number of enterprises receiving non- financial support	Enterprises	ERDF	More developed	0.00	0.00	
2	F	12	Total amount of eligible expenditure entered into the accounting system of the certifying authority and certified by the authority	€	ERDF	More developed	0.00	0.00	
2	I	13	% of final target for number of enterprises receiving non-financial support	%	ERDF	More developed	0.00	0.00	

	Ind type	ID	Indicator	Measurement unit	Fund	Category of region	2015 Cum total	2014 Cum total	Observations
			that has been achieved by partially completed and fully completed operations						
2	О	CO04	Productive investment: Number of enterprises receiving non- financial support	Enterprises	ERDF	More developed	0.00	0.00	
3	F	12	Total amount of eligible expenditure entered into the accounting system of the certifying authority and certified by the authority	€	ERDF	More developed	0.00	0.00	
3	I	I4	% of final target for householder with improved energy consumption classification has been achieved by partially completed and fully completed operations	%	ERDF	More developed	0.00	0.00	
3	0	CO31	Energy efficiency: Number of households with improved energy consumption classification	Households	ERDF	More developed	0.00	0.00	
4	F	12	Total amount of eligible expenditure entered into the accounting system of the certifying authority and certified by the authority	€	ERDF	More developed	0.00	0.00	
4	I	15	X% of the priority financial allocation accounted by contractural agreements to deliver infrastructure works	%	ERDF	More developed	0.00	0.00	
4	0	J22	Gross passenger kilometres on public trnsport	passenger km	ERDF	More developed	0.00	0.00	

Priority axis			Measurement unit	Fund	Category of region	Milestone for 2018 total	Milestone for 2018 men	Milestone for 2018 women	Final target (2023) total	Final target (2023) men	Final target (2023) women
1	F	Total amount of eligible expenditure entered into the accounting system of the certifying authority and certified		ERDF	More developed	45500000			178,200,000.00		

Priority axis	Ind type	ID	Indicator	Measurement unit	Fund	Category of region	Milestone for 2018 total	Milestone for 2018 men	Milestone for 2018 women	Final target (2023) total	Final target (2023) men	Final target (2023) women
			by the authority									
1	I	12	% of final target for 'number of enterprises receiving non-financial support' which has been achieved by partially completed and fully completed operations	%	ERDF	More developed	28			100.00		
1	О	CO04	Productive investment: Number of enterprises receiving non- financial support	Enterprises	ERDF	More developed	n/a			2,245.00		
2	F	12	Total amount of eligible expenditure entered into the accounting system of the certifying authority and certified by the authority	€	ERDF	More developed	20300000			79,700,000.00		
2	I	13	% of final target for number of enterprises receiving non- financial support that has been achieved by partially completed and fully completed operations	%	ERDF	More developed	28			100.00		
2	0	CO04	Productive investment: Number of enterprises receiving non- financial support	Enterprises	ERDF	More developed	n/a			6,420.00		
3	F	12	Total amount of eligible expenditure entered into the accounting system of the certifying authority and certified by the authority	ϵ	ERDF	More developed	11400000			44,800,000.00		
3	I	I4	% of final target for householder with improved energy consumption classification has been achieved by partially completed and fully completed operations	%	ERDF	More developed	50			100.00		
3	0	CO31	Energy efficiency: Number of households with improved energy consumption classification	Households	ERDF	More developed	n/a			4,200.00		
4	F	12	Total amount of eligible expenditure entered into the accounting system of	ϵ	ERDF	More developed	24450000			95,700,000.00		

Priority axis			Measurement unit	Fund	Category of region	Milestone for 2018 total	Milestone for 2018 men	Milestone for 2018 women	Final target (2023) total	Final target (2023) men	Final target (2023) women
		the certifying authority and certified by the authority									
4	I	X% of the priority financial allocation accounted by contractural agreements to deliver infrastructure works		ERDF	More developed	75%					
4	О	Gross passenger kilometres on public trnsport	passenger km	ERDF	More developed	n/a			67,200,000.00		

3.4 Financial data (Article 50(2) of Regulation (EU) No 1303/2013)

Table 6: Financial information at priority axis and programme level

(as set out in Table 1 of Annex II to Commission Implementing Regulation (EU) No 1011/2014 (Model for the transmission of financial data))

Priority axis	Fund	Category of region	Calculation basis	Total fund	Co-financing rate	Total eligible cost of operations selected for support	Proportion of the total allocation covered with selected operations	Public eligible cost of operations selected for support	Total eligible expenditure declared by beneficiaries to the managing authority	Proportion of the total allocation covered by eligible expenditure declared by beneficiaries	Number of operations selected
1	ERDF	More developed	Total	178,203,132.00	50.00	163,860,690.00	91.95%	106,330,703.00	19,138,467.00	10.74%	7
2	ERDF	More developed	Total	79,740,942.00	50.00	77,684,838.00	97.42%	53,003,204.00	26,822,391.00	33.64%	7
3	ERDF	More developed	Total	44,800,782.00	50.00	8,875,000.00	19.81%	4,437,500.00	0.00	0.00%	1
4	ERDF	More developed	Total	95,747,162.00	50.00	23,248,245.00	24.28%	23,248,245.00	0.00	0.00%	2
5	ERDF	More developed	Total	8,132,490.00	50.00	8,824,423.00	108.51%	8,436,923.00	13,789.00	0.17%	6
Total	ERDF	More developed		406,624,508.00	50.00	282,493,196.00	69.47%	195,456,575.00	45,974,647.00	11.31%	23
Grand total				406,624,508.00	50.00	282,493,196.00	69.47%	195,456,575.00	45,974,647.00	11.31%	23

Table 7: Breakdown of the cumulative financial data by category of intervention for the ERDF, the ESF and the Cohesion Fund (Article 112(1) and (2) of Regulation (EU) No 1303/2013 and Article 5 of Regulation (EU) No 1304/2013)

Priority axis	Characteristic	cs of expenditure				Categorisati	on dimensions					Financ	ial data	
	Fund	Category of region	Intervention field	Form of finance	Territorial dimension	Territorial delivery mechanism	Thematic objective dimension	ESF secondary theme	Economic dimension	Location dimension	Total eligible cost of operations selected for support	Public eligible cost of operations selected for support	Total elegibile expenditure declared by beneficiaries to the managing authority	Number of operations selected
1	ERDF	More developed												
1	ERDF	More developed	058	01	01	07	01	08, 08, 08, 08, 08, 08, 08, 08	08	UKL2	19,574,525.00	18,369,788.00	19,138,467.00	1
1	ERDF	More developed	058	01	07	07	01	08, 08, 08, 08, 08, 08, 08, 08	24	UKL2	40,837,500.00	16,437,500.00	0.00	1
1	ERDF	More developed	060	01	07	07	01	08, 08, 08, 08, 08, 08, 08, 08	24	UKL2	35,376,111.00	35,376,111.00	0.00	2
1	ERDF	More developed	064	01	07	07	01	08, 08, 08, 08, 08, 08, 08, 08	24	UKL2	68,072,554.00	36,147,304.00	0.00	3
2	ERDF	More developed												
2	ERDF	More developed	066	01	07	07	03	08, 08, 08, 08, 08, 08, 08, 08	24	UKL2	13,733,104.00	13,733,104.00	1,380,734.00	1
2	ERDF	More developed	066	03	07	07	03	08, 08, 08, 08, 08, 08, 08, 08	16	UKL2	15,495,041.00	6,721,935.00	6,673,466.00	1
2	ERDF	More developed	066	04	07	07	03	08, 08, 08, 08, 08, 08, 08, 08	16	UKL2	27,277,994.00	11,994,466.00	17,049,537.00	1
2	ERDF	More developed	067	01	07	07	03	08, 08, 08, 08, 08, 08, 08, 08	24	UKL2	12,761,104.00	12,761,104.00	1,254,274.00	1
2	ERDF	More developed	073	01	07	07	03	08, 08, 08, 08, 08, 08, 08, 08	24	UKL2	2,749,036.00	2,749,036.00	464,380.00	1
2	ERDF	More developed	073	02	07	07	03	08, 08, 08, 08, 08, 08, 08, 08	24	UKL2	1,250,000.00	625,000.00	0.00	1
2	ERDF	More developed	082	01	07	07	03	08, 08, 08, 08, 08, 08, 08, 08	24	UKL2	4,418,559.00	4,418,559.00	0.00	1
3	ERDF	More developed												
3	ERDF	More developed	014	01	07	07	04	08, 08, 08, 08, 08, 08, 08, 08	24	UKL2	8,875,000.00	4,437,500.00	0.00	1
4	ERDF	More developed												
4	ERDF	More developed	046	01	07	07	02	08, 08, 08, 08, 08, 08, 08, 08	13	UKL2	17,741,502.00	17,741,502.00	0.00	1
4	ERDF	More developed	047	01	07	07	02	08, 08, 08, 08, 08, 08, 08, 08	13	UKL2	5,506,743.00	5,506,743.00	0.00	1
5	ERDF	More developed												
5	ERDF	More developed	121	01	07	07		08, 08, 08, 08, 08, 08, 08, 08	18	UKL2	8,531,740.00	8,144,240.00	7,027.00	3
5	ERDF	More developed	123	01	07	07		08, 08, 08, 08,	24	UKL2	292,683.00	292,683.00	6,762.00	3

Priority axis	Characteristics	of expenditure				Categorisatio	n dimensions					Financ	ial data	
	Fund	Category of region	Intervention field	Form of finance	Territorial dimension	Territorial delivery mechanism	Thematic objective dimension	ESF secondary theme	Economic dimension	Location dimension	Total eligible cost of operations selected for support	Public eligible cost of operations selected for support	Total elegibile expenditure declared by beneficiaries to the managing authority	Number of operations selected
	•					•	•	08, 08, 08, 08	•					

Table 8: The use made of cross-financing

1	2	3	4	5	6
Use of cross-financing	Priority axis	The amount of EU support envisaged to be used for cross financing based on selected operations (EUR)	Share of the total financial allocation to the priority axis (%) (3/total financial allocation to priority axis*100)	Eligible expenditure used under cross financing declared by the beneficiary to the managing authority (EUR)	Share of the total financial allocation to the priority axis (%) (5/total financial allocation to priority axis*100)

Table 9: Cost of operations implemented outside the programme area (the ERDF and the Cohesion Fund under the Investment for growth and jobs goal)

1	2	3	4	5
Priority axis	The amount of support envisaged to be used for operations implemented outside the programme area based on selected operations (EUR)	Share of the total financial allocation to the priority axis (%) (3/total financial allocation to priority axis*100)	Eligible expenditure incurred in operations implemented outside the programme area declared by the beneficiary to the managing authority (EUR)	Share of the total financial allocation to the priority axis (%) (5/total financial allocation to priority axis*100)

Table 10: Expenditure incurred outside the Union (ESF)

The amount of expenditure envisaged to be incurred outside	Share of the total financial allocation (Union and national	Eligible expenditure incurred outside the Union declared by the	Share of the total financial allocation (Union and national
the Union under thematic	contribution) to the ESF programme	beneficiary to the managing	contribution) to the ESF programme
objectives 8 and 10 based on	or the ESF part of a multi-fund	authority (EUR)	or the ESF part of a multi-fund
selected operations (EUR)	programme (%) (1/total financial		programme (%) (3/total financial
	allocation (Union and national		allocation (Union and national
	contribution) to the ESF programme		contribution) to the ESF programme
	or the ESF part of a multi-fund		or the ESF part of a multi-fund
	programme*100)		programme*100)

4. SYNTHESIS OF THE EVALUATIONS

Synthesis of the findings of all evaluations of the programme that have become available during the previous financial year, with reference of name and reference period of the evaluation reports used

No evaluations of the 2014-2020 programmes became available during the year. However, during 2016, WEFO finalised the Evaluation of ERDF Support for Businesses in the 2007-2013 period. The findings of this evaluation are outlined below.

The rationale for ERDF funded business support was found to be valid at the time the ERDF Programmes were developed and broadly remained valid during the programming period. However the evaluation recommended that the Welsh Government bases future business support on a more detailed analysis of the different types of market and other failures so that the support is more focussed on addressing these failures. To address this, the 2014-2020 ERDF Programmes contain a small number of clearly described objectives and targets relating to specific development needs and market failures.

Amongst surveyed businesses who said they had received financial support only a minority had previously applied for funding elsewhere, suggesting that the majority of ERDF financially supported businesses were not treating the ERDF funding as a 'last resort' funding source. The evaluation therefore recommended that for future business support, the Welsh Government gives greater consideration to clear evidence of market / other failure.

The evaluation also found that, where businesses had received financial support, the actual amount of financial support given to businesses had no significant effect on the impact of the support, i.e. larger grants did not necessarily lead to larger impacts. A similar finding was found in a review of impact evaluations undertaken by the European Commission (EC). This may suggest that it is the other elements of support that come with the payment that generates the impact, and not the actual payment itself. The evaluation recommended that future programmes encourage businesses towards repayable finance rather than grants. In the 2014-2020 ERDF Programmes the majority of support to businesses is being delivered via non-financial support and repayable finance.

Only a minority of surveyed businesses said that the support had led them to create jobs or increase their turnover. This may be because businesses tend to under-value external business advice and over-value financial support. The evaluators attempted to test this more rigorously in the Counterfactual Impact Evaluation analysis. Although this analysis was not perfect, it suggested that the ERDF support has had a positive effect on the employment and turnover of supported businesses, but with a slightly negative effect on productivity. One explanation for this is that the support may be 'propping-up' inefficient businesses artificially. An alternative explanation is that, as the measure of productivity used here is turnover per employee, whilst the ERDF support has had positive effects on both employment and turnover, the effects on employment are larger than the effects on turnover. For example, where a business recruits new staff to

produce new products or services or to operate new equipment there may be an initial negative effect on productivity until the business learns to produce at a more efficient rate. It may be the case that, in the long-term, ERDF-supported businesses may become more productive than other businesses.

Overall, the evaluators concluded that the ERDF support has had a modest positive impact on supported businesses. They judged that the reason for the modest impact is the lack of targeting of support to businesses with growth potential, with reported average salary levels in ERDF-supported businesses slightly lower than the Wales average. The evaluation therefore recommended that future support be more targeted at businesses with growth potential. In the 2014-2020 ERDF Programmes include increased targeting of businesses with the greatest growth potential to maximise economic growth and job creation.

Almost 10% of surveyed businesses stated that they would have been unlikely to continue operating if they had not received the ERDF support and 20% of surveyed new-start businesses stated that it is unlikely that they would have started up without the ERDF support.

The evaluation suggested that, without the ERDF funding, research projects would have operated at a smaller scale. The evaluation also found that ERDF helped improve collaborations between universities, and between universities and businesses.

The evaluation found that, since the 2011 survey, there has been an increase in the number of businesses reporting receiving specific support on environmental sustainability or equal opportunity issues. However, progress against the Cross Cutting Themes indicators remained behind target at the time of the evaluation. The evaluation recommended that the Cross Cutting Themes receive greater attention in future ERDF approvals and monitoring. For the 2014-2020 Programmes, each project must identify Cross Cutting Themes actions (case level indicators) within their Business Plan, against which, progress will be reviewed at quarterly progress review meetings.

Finally, the evaluation recommended that WEFO improves the quality of its monitoring information on ERDF-supported businesses to increase the robustness of future evaluations. To address this, WEFO redesigned the business-level database for the 2014-2020 ERDF Programmes and claims are not being processed until the required business level data have been submitted.

The report of the 2011 ERDF Business Survey can be found at http://gov.wales/funding/eu-funds/previous/programme-evaluation/erdf-business-survey/?lang=en.

6. ISSUES AFFECTING THE PERFORMANCE OF THE PROGRAMME AND MEASURES TAKEN (ARTICLE 50(2) OF REGULATION (EU) NO 1303/2013)

(a) Issues which affect the performance of the programme and the measures taken

The prime focus during 2016 for the ERDF Programmes has been to continue to develop backbone operations alongside key regionally prioritised gap fillers.

New operations continue to be approved a number of which have entered a mobilisation phase. WEFO has provided beneficiaries with support during this phase to ensure, once operations are ready to commence delivery they do so quickly and effectively. There have been some issues around data capture and reporting systems but generally these processing issues have been resolved satisfactorily. Those operations now in delivery are making good progress with WEFO continuing to hold regular review meetings with stakeholders/beneficiaries to communicate best practice and help keep delivery on track.

As at 31 December 2016, WEFO met its target of committing 60% of the estimated fund value. During 2016 WEFO made four claims, two for each of the Programmes. As a result of claims being made WEFO has increased its Monitoring and Verification procedures. This work has been supported with a number of workshops that target beneficiaries to assist them to better understand issues of eligibility and compliance and thereby further reducing the risk of potential errors and irregularities being recorded.

Following the UK referendum on membership of the European Union WEFO had some concerns that potential beneficiaries might show some reluctance to show an interest in seeking EU support and commit to operations that demonstrate the need for support. This however has not materialised with strong interest in the programmes continuing across all sectors and across all Priorities.

(b) An assessment of whether progress made towards targets is sufficient to ensure their fulfilment, indicating any remedial actions taken or planned, where appropriate.

In accordance with the AIR reporting model, this information can be found under Section 11.1.

7. CITIZEN'S SUMMARY

A citizen's summary of the contents of the annual implementation report can be found at Annex 1.

I. Identification of the programme and priority or mea from the ESI Funds is provided (Article 46(2)(a) of Reg							
1. Priority axes or measures supporting the financial instrument, including fund of funds, under the ESI Fund programme.							
1.1. Priority axis supporting the financial instrument under the ESI Fund programme	2 - SME Competitiveness						
2. Name of ESI Fund(s) supporting the financial instrument under the priority axis or measure	ERDF						
3. Thematic objective(s) referred to in the first paragraph of Article 9 of Regulation (EU) No 1303/2013 supported by the financial instrument	03 - Enhancing the competitiveness of small and medium-sized enterprises, the agricultural sector (for the EAFRD) and the fisheries and aquaculture sector (for the EMFF)						
3.1. Amount of ESI Funds committed in funding agreements from the individual thematic objective chosen in field 3 (optional)							
4. other ESI Fund programmes providing contribution	to the financial instrument						
4.1. CCI number of each other ESI Fund programme providing contributions to the financial instrument	2014UK16RFOP005						
30. Date of completion of the ex ante assessment	30-Sep-2015						
31. Selection of bodies implementing financial instrume	ent						
31.1. Has selection or designation process already been launched	Yes						
II. Description of the financial instrument and implement (Article 46(2)(b) of Regulation (EU) No 1303/2013)	entation arrangements						
5. Name of the financial instrument	The Wales Business Fund (supported by ERDF) SO2.1 EW						
6. Official address/place of business of the financial instrument (name of the country and city)	Wales, United Kingdom, Cardiff						
7. Implementation arrangements							
7.1. Financial instruments set up at Union level, managed directly or indirectly by the Commission referred to in	No						

Article 38(1)(a) of Regulation (EU) No 1303/2013, supported from ESI Fund programme contributions	
7.1.1. Name of the Union-level financial instrument	
7.2. Financial instrument set up at national, regional, transnational or cross-border level, managed by or under the responsibility of the managing authority referred to in Article 38(1)(b), supported from ESI Fund programme contributions under point (a), (b) and (c) of Article 38(4) of Regulation (EU) No 1303/2013	Entrustment of implementation
8. Type of the financial instrument	Fund of funds
10. Legal status of the financial instrument, pursuant to Article 38(6) of Regulation (EU) No 1303/2013 (for financial instruments referred to in Article 38(4)(b) only): fiduciary account opened in the name of the implementing body and on behalf of the managing authority or separate block of finance within a financial institution	Separate block of finance
III. Identification of the body implementing the financial in Articles 38(1)(a), 38(4)(a), (b) and (c) of Regulation (financial intermediaries referred to in Article 38(5) of I 1303/2013 (Article 46(2)(c) of Regulation (EU) No 1303.	EU) No 1303/2013, and the Regulation (EU) No
11. Body implementing the financial instrument	
11.1. Type of implementing body pursuant to Article 38(4) of Regulation (EU) No 1303/2013 (a) existing or newly created legal entity dedicated to implementing financial instruments; (b) a body entrusted with the implementation task or (c) managing authority underatking implementation task directly (for loans or guarantees only)	Existing or newly created legal entity
11.1.1. Name of the body implementing the financial instrument	Finance Wales Investments Ltd
11.1.2. Official address/place of business (country and town name) of the body implementing the financial instrument	Wales, United Kingdom, Cardiff
12. Procedure of selecting the body implementing the financial instrument: award of a public contract; other procedure	Selection in accordance with the provisions of the public procurement directive
12.1. Description of the other procedure of selecting the body implementing the financial instrument	

IV. Total amount of programme contributions, by priority or measure, paid to the financial instrument and management costs incurred or management fees paid (Article 46(2)(d) and (e) of Regulation (EU) No 1303/2013)					
14. Total amount of programme contributions committed in the funding agreement (in EUR)	40,500,000.00				
14.1. out of which ESI Funds contributions (in EUR)	12,375,000.00				
14.1.1. out of which ERDF (in EUR) (optional)					
14.1.2. out of which Cohesion Fund (in EUR) (optional)					
14.1.3. out of which ESF (in EUR) (optional)					
14.1.4. out of which EAFRD (in EUR) (optional)					
14.1.5. out of which EMFF (in EUR) (optional)					
15. Total amount of programme contributions paid to the financial instrument (in EUR)	11,869,588.84				
15.1. out of which amount of ESI Funds contributions (in EUR)	2,494,588.84				
15.1.1. out of which ERDF (in EUR)	2,494,588.84				
15.1.2. out of which Cohesion Fund (in EUR)	0.00				
15.1.3. out of which ESF (in EUR)	0.00				
15.1.4. out of which EAFRD (in EUR)	0.00				
15.1.5. out of which EMFF (in EUR)	0.00				
15.2. out of which total amount of national co-financing (in EUR)	9,375,000.00				
15.2.1. out of which total amount of national public funding (in EUR)	9,375,000.00				
15.2.2. out of which total amount of national private funding (in EUR)	0.00				
16. Total amount of programme contributions paid to the financial instrument under Youth Employment Initiative (YEI) (in EUR)	0.00				
17. Total amount of management costs and fees paid out of programme contributions (in EUR)	322,056.76				
17.1. out of which base remuneration (in EUR)	322,056.76				
17.2. out of which performance-based remuneration (in EUR)	0.00				
18. Capitalised management costs or fees pursuant to Article 42(2) of Regulation (EU) No 1303/2013 (relevant only for final report) (in EUR)					

19. Capitalised interest rate subsidies or guarantee fee	
subsidies pursuant to Article 42(1)(c) of Regulation (EU) No 1303/2013 (relevant to final report only) (in EUR)	
20. Amount of programme contributions for follow-on investments in final recipients pursuant to Article 42(3) of Regulation (EU) No 1303/2013 (relevant for final report only) (in EUR)	
21. Contributions of land and/or real estate in the financial instrument pursuant to Article 37(10) of Regulation (EU) No 1303/2013 (relevant for final report only) (in EUR)	
VI. The performance of the financial instrument, included and in selection of bodies implementing the financial instrument body implementing a fund of funds) (Article 46(2)(f) of 1303/2013)	strument (including the
32. Information whether the financial instrument was still operational at the end of the reporting year	Yes
32.1. If the financial instrument was not operational at the end of the reporting year, date of the winding-up	
financial instrument, programme resources paid back to investments as referred to in Articles 43 and 44, and the investments with respect to previous years (Article 46(2 (EU) No 1303/2013)	e value of equity
35. Interest and other gains generated by payments from ESI Funds to the financial instrument (in EUR)	321.85
37. Amounts of resources reused which were paid back to the financial instrument and are attributable to ESI Funds	0.00
37.1. out of which amounts paid for preferential remuneration of private investors operating under the market economy principle who provide counterpart resources to the support from the ESI Funds to the financial instrument or who co-invest at the level of final recipient (in EUR)	0.00
37.2. out of which amounts paid for the reimbursement of management costs incurred and payment of management fees of the financial instrument (in EUR)	0.00
VIII. Progress in achieving the expected leverage effect financial instrument and value of investments and particles.	<u> </u>

EN 71 **EN**

38. Total amount of other contributions, outside ESI Funds, raised by the financial

instrument (EUR)	
38.1. Total amount of other contributions, outside the ESI Funds committed in the funding agreement with the body implementing the financial instrument (in EUR)	28,125,000.00
38.2. Total amount of other contributions, outside the ESI Funds paid to the financial instrument (in EUR)	9,375,000.00
38.2.1. out of which public contributions (EUR)	9,375,000.00
38.2.2. out of which private contributions (EUR)	0.00

I. Identification of the programme and priority or measure from which support from the ESI Funds is provided (Article 46(2)(a) of Regulation (EU) No 1303/2013) 1. Priority axes or measures supporting the financial instrument, including fund of funds, under the ESI Fund programme.		
2. Name of ESI Fund(s) supporting the financial instrument under the priority axis or measure	ERDF	
3. Thematic objective(s) referred to in the first paragraph of Article 9 of Regulation (EU) No 1303/2013 supported by the financial instrument	01 - Strengthening research, technological development and innovation	
3.1. Amount of ESI Funds committed in funding agreements from the individual thematic objective chosen in field 3 (optional)		
4. other ESI Fund programmes providing contribution	n to the financial instrument	
4.1. CCI number of each other ESI Fund programme providing contributions to the financial instrument	2014UK16RFOP005	
30. Date of completion of the ex ante assessment	30-Sep-2015	
31. Selection of bodies implementing financial instrum	ent	
31.1. Has selection or designation process already been launched	Yes	
II. Description of the financial instrument and implem (Article 46(2)(b) of Regulation (EU) No 1303/2013)	entation arrangements	
5. Name of the financial instrument	The Wales Business Fund (supported by ERDF) SO2.5 EW	
6. Official address/place of business of the financial instrument (name of the country and city)	Wales, United Kingdom, Cardiff	
7. Implementation arrangements		

7.1. Financial instruments set up at Union level, managed directly or indirectly by the Commission referred to in Article 38(1)(a) of Regulation (EU) No 1303/2013, supported from ESI Fund programme contributions	No
7.1.1. Name of the Union-level financial instrument	
7.2. Financial instrument set up at national, regional, transnational or cross-border level, managed by or under the responsibility of the managing authority referred to in Article 38(1)(b), supported from ESI Fund programme contributions under point (a), (b) and (c) of Article 38(4) of Regulation (EU) No 1303/2013	Entrustment of implementation
8. Type of the financial instrument	Fund of funds
10. Legal status of the financial instrument, pursuant to Article 38(6) of Regulation (EU) No 1303/2013 (for financial instruments referred to in Article 38(4)(b) only): fiduciary account opened in the name of the implementing body and on behalf of the managing authority or separate block of finance within a financial institution	Separate block of finance
in Articles 38(1)(a), 38(4)(a), (b) and (c) of Regulation (financial intermediaries referred to in Article 38(5) of E 1303/2013 (Article 46(2)(c) of Regulation (EU) No 1303/11. Body implementing the financial instrument	Regulation (EU) No
	Б. 4.
11.1. Type of implementing body pursuant to Article 38(4) of Regulation (EU) No 1303/2013 (a) existing or newly created legal entity dedicated to implementing financial instruments; (b) a body entrusted with the implementation task or (c) managing authority underatking implementation task directly (for loans or guarantees only)	Existing or newly created legal entity
11.1.1. Name of the body implementing the financial instrument	Finance Wales Investments Ltd
11.1.2. Official address/place of business (country and town name) of the body implementing the financial instrument	Wales, United Kingdom, Cardiff
12. Procedure of selecting the body implementing the financial instrument: award of a public contract; other procedure	Selection in accordance with the provisions of the public procurement directive
12.1. Description of the other procedure of selecting the body implementing the financial instrument	

13. Date of signature of the funding agreement with the body implementing the financial instrument	15-Dec-2016
IV. Total amount of programme contributions, by prior financial instrument and management costs incurred or (Article 46(2)(d) and (e) of Regulation (EU) No 1303/20	r management fees paid
14. Total amount of programme contributions committed in the funding agreement (in EUR)	16,250,000.00
14.1. out of which ESI Funds contributions (in EUR)	6,875,000.00
14.1.1. out of which ERDF (in EUR) (optional)	
14.1.2. out of which Cohesion Fund (in EUR) (optional)	
14.1.3. out of which ESF (in EUR) (optional)	
14.1.4. out of which EAFRD (in EUR) (optional)	
14.1.5. out of which EMFF (in EUR) (optional)	
15. Total amount of programme contributions paid to the financial instrument (in EUR)	3,878,125.01
15.1. out of which amount of ESI Funds contributions (in EUR)	753,125.01
15.1.1. out of which ERDF (in EUR)	753,125.01
15.1.2. out of which Cohesion Fund (in EUR)	0.00
15.1.3. out of which ESF (in EUR)	0.00
15.1.4. out of which EAFRD (in EUR)	0.00
15.1.5. out of which EMFF (in EUR)	0.00
15.2. out of which total amount of national co-financing (in EUR)	3,125,000.00
15.2.1. out of which total amount of national public funding (in EUR)	3,125,000.00
15.2.2. out of which total amount of national private funding (in EUR)	0.00
16. Total amount of programme contributions paid to the financial instrument under Youth Employment Initiative (YEI) (in EUR)	0.00
17. Total amount of management costs and fees paid out of programme contributions (in EUR)	129,220.30
17.1. out of which base remuneration (in EUR)	129,220.30
17.2. out of which performance-based remuneration (in EUR)	0.00
18. Capitalised management costs or fees pursuant to	

Article 42(2) of Regulation (EU) No 1303/2013 (relevant only for final report) (in EUR)	
19. Capitalised interest rate subsidies or guarantee fee subsidies pursuant to Article 42(1)(c) of Regulation (EU) No 1303/2013 (relevant to final report only) (in EUR)	
20. Amount of programme contributions for follow-on investments in final recipients pursuant to Article 42(3) of Regulation (EU) No 1303/2013 (relevant for final report only) (in EUR)	
21. Contributions of land and/or real estate in the financial instrument pursuant to Article 37(10) of Regulation (EU) No 1303/2013 (relevant for final report only) (in EUR)	
VI. The performance of the financial instrument, included and in selection of bodies implementing the financial instrument body implementing a fund of funds) (Article 46(2)(f) of 1303/2013)	strument (including the
32. Information whether the financial instrument was still operational at the end of the reporting year	Yes
32.1. If the financial instrument was not operational at the end of the reporting year, date of the winding-up	
VII. Interest and other gains generated by support from financial instrument, programme resources paid back to investments as referred to in Articles 43 and 44, and the investments with respect to previous years (Article 46(2 (EU) No 1303/2013)	o financial instrument from e value of equity
35. Interest and other gains generated by payments from ESI Funds to the financial instrument (in EUR)	294.63
37. Amounts of resources reused which were paid back to the financial instrument and are attributable to ESI Funds	0.00
37.1. out of which amounts paid for preferential remuneration of private investors operating under the market economy principle who provide counterpart resources to the support from the ESI Funds to the financial instrument or who co-invest at the level of final recipient (in EUR)	0.00
37.2. out of which amounts paid for the reimbursement of management costs incurred and payment of management fees of the financial instrument (in EUR)	0.00
VIII. Progress in achieving the expected leverage effect	of investments made by the

VIII. Progress in achieving the expected leverage effect of investments made by the financial instrument and value of investments and participations (Article 46(2)(h) of Regulation (EU) No 1303/2013)

38. Total amount of other contributions, outside ESI Funds, raised by the financial instrument (EUR)					
38.1. Total amount of other contributions, outside the ESI Funds committed in the funding agreement with the body implementing the financial instrument (in EUR)	9,375,000.00				
38.2. Total amount of other contributions, outside the ESI Funds paid to the financial instrument (in EUR)	3,125,000.00				
38.2.1. out of which public contributions (EUR)	3,125,000.00				
38.2.2. out of which private contributions (EUR)	0.00				

9. OPTIONAL FOR THE REPORT TO BE SUBMITTED IN 2016, NOT APPLICABLE TO OTHER LIGHT REPORTS: ACTIONS TAKEN TO FULFILL EX-ANTE CONDITIONALITIES

Table 14: Actions taken to fulfil applicable general ex-ante conditionalities

on of remaining actions	General ex-ante conditionality	Criteria not fulfilled	Actions taken	Deadline	Bodies responsible	Action completed by the deadline	Criteria fulfilled	remaining	Commentary
-------------------------	--------------------------------	------------------------	---------------	----------	--------------------	-------------------------------------	-----------------------	-----------	------------

Not applicable to the Programme.

Table 15: Actions taken to fulfil applicable thematic ex-ante conditionalities

General ex-ante conditionality	Criteria not fulfilled	Actions taken	Deadline	Bodies responsible	Action completed by the deadline	Criteria fulfilled	Expected date for full implementati on of remaining actions	Commentary
--------------------------------	------------------------	------------------	----------	--------------------	-------------------------------------	-----------------------	---	------------

Not applicable to the Programme.

10. PROGRESS IN PREPARATION AND IMPLEMENTATION OF MAJOR PROJECTS AND JOINT ACTION PLANS (ARTICLE 101(H) AND 111(3) OF REGULATION (EU) NO 1303/2013)

10.1. Major projects

Table 12: Major projects

Project	CCI	Status of MP	Total investments	notification / submission	agreement /	Planned start of implementation (year, quarter)	completion	•	realisation — financial progress (% of expenditure	realisation — physical progress	Date of signature of first works contract	Observations
									Commission compared to total eligible cost)			

There may be the need to submit a major project for the Metro but this will not be confirmed until summer 2017.

Significant problems encountered in implementing major projects and measures taken to overcome them

There may be the need to submit a major project for the Metro but this will not be confirmed until summer 2017.

Any change planned in the list of major projects in the operational programme

There may be the need to submit a major project for the Metro but this will not be confirmed until summer 2017.

10.2. Joint action plans

Progress in the implementation of different stages of joint action plans

There are no joint action plans under the Programme.

Table 13: Joint action plans (JAP)

Title of the JAP	CCI	Stage of implementatio	Total eligible	Total public support		Priority axis	* 1	[Planned] submission to	[Planned] start	[Planned] completion	Total eligible expenditure	Observations
		n of JAP	costs		JAI	axis		the	implementatio n	Completion	certified to the Commission	

There are no joint action plans under the Programme.

Significant problems encountered and measures taken to overcome them

There are no joint action plans under the Programme.

PART B

REPORTING SUBMITTED IN YEARS 2017, 2019 AND FINAL IMPLEMENTATION REPORT (Article 50(4), 111(3) and (4) of regulation (EU) No 1303/2013

11. ASSESSMENT OF THE IMPLEMENTATION OF THE OPERATIONAL PROGRAMME (ARTICLES 50(4) AND 111(4) OF REGULATION (EU) NO 1303/2013)

11.1. Information in Part A and achieving objectives of the programme (Article 50(4) of Regulation (EU) No 1303/2013)

Priority axis 1 - Research and Innovation

SO1.1: The value of the result indicator in 2016 was £117.4million. Data for 2015 and 2016 are calculated differently to previous years which makes comparisons since the baseline difficult. At this stage it is still a little early to assess the contribution of this SO to the result indicator and an evaluation has not yet been undertaken. We expect result indicator data for 2016 onwards to be consistent from that point onwards. Research will be undertaken with supported HEIs to explore whether their income from research grants and contracts has increased overall, and the contribution of the SO to this.

SO1.2: Data for the result indicator were not available in 2016. As the source of this result indicator is a survey undertaken every two years the latest data we have is for 2014: 56.8% of businesses. At that stage it would have been too early to see any contribution of the Programme to the result indicator. Research will be undertaken with supported businesses to determine whether they have successfully undertaken any product or process innovation as a result of their support, whether this was commercialised and whether this led to an increase in turnover. A CIE will also be attempted using data linking to observe any changes in turnover for supported businesses and compare this with a control group.

Priority axis 2 - S	SME Competitiveness
---------------------	---------------------

SO2.1: The latest available data for the result indicator is for 2015: £16million. As this was before the launch of the Wales Business Fund it is too early to assess any contribution to the result indicator. A dedicated evaluation of the Wales Business Fund will be undertaken to assess whether the Fund has led to any contribution to the result indicator.

SO2.2: The latest available data for the result indicator is for 2015: 4,965 new enterprises. At this stage it is still a little early to assess the contribution of this SO to the result indicator and an evaluation has not yet been undertaken. Research will be undertaken with supported businesses to determine the extent to which interventions funded by the SO helped them create their business, the scale of any effect, and whether it is likely to have affected the result indicator.

SO2.3: We are currently unable to access data for the result indicator. We are exploring

this with Ofcom Wales, the data provider. Depending on the outcome of this, we may need to change the result indicator. The evaluation approach to the result indicator for this SO will involve research with supported businesses to assess whether and to what extent they have increased up-take of fibre and cable broadband, whether the interventions funded by the SO played a role in this and what effects, if any, this has had on their business performance. A CIE may be feasible to assess any effects on business performance.

SO2.4: The value of the result indicator for this SO in 2016 was 124,600 employed people. At this stage it is still a little early to assess the contribution of this SO to the result indicator and an evaluation has not yet been undertaken. A CIE will be attempted to compare any changes in employment amongst supported businesses with those of a control group. Research will also be undertaken with supported businesses to get their feedback on the support they received through this SO.

SO2.5: The latest available data for the result indicator is for 2015: £9million. As this was before the launch of the Wales Business Fund it is too early to assess any contribution to the result indicator. A dedicated evaluation of the Wales Business Fund will be undertaken to assess whether the Fund has led to any contribution to the result indicator.

Priority axis	3 - Renewable Energy and Energy
	Efficiency

SO3.1: The latest available data for the result indicator is for 2015: 812 sites. It is too early to assess the contribution of this SO to the result indicator and an evaluation has not yet been undertaken. The evaluation approach to this result indicator will involve direct monitoring of the number of supported sites generating electricity from renewable sources under this SO and estimating the contribution of the SO to the result indicator with a consideration of any other factors which may have had an effect (e.g. new sites not supported by ERDF).

SO3.2: As the result indicator for this SO directly measures the number of households that have had their energy performance improved as a result of interventions under the SO and, at the time of writing, ARBED, the main intervention under this SO, has not yet started delivering it is not possible to update this result indicator yet. The evaluation approach to this result indicator will involve comparing the potential energy efficiency rating on the Energy Performance Certificate (EPC) with the original energy efficiency rating on the EPC for supported households. As the potential energy efficiency rating is calculated on the basis of energy efficient measures being installed by ARBED this approach will capture the energy improvements as a result of the measures. The evaluation will also focus on delivery, an assessment of the quality and accuracy of the EPC calculations and the quality of the installations.

Priority axis	4 - Connectivity
---------------	------------------

SO4.1: The data for the result indicator for this SO is available on request only. As project activity is not sufficiently advanced, data have not been requested. The evaluation approach to this SO will involve direct monitoring of passenger numbers on supported public transport pre (baseline) and after the improvements have been made. The evaluation will consider other factors which may have had an effect on the result indicator, e.g. other transport developments not supported by ERDF, population growth etc.

SO4.2: The value of the result indicator for this SO in 2016 was 85% of premises. However, the indicator used has changed from previous years. Data for 2016 are not available for NGA networks. Instead, we have recorded data for 'Proportion of premises able to receive superfast or higher broadband services' (Source: The Communications Market survey: Wales, Ofcom, 2017). This is slightly different from the NGA indicator as not all NGA broadband connections are capable of providing superfast broadband services (i.e. those with an actual speed of 30Mbit/s or higher). Therefore, the percentage of premises able to receive superfast broadband will be lower than the percentage of premises in postcodes served by NGA networks. At this stage it is still a little early to assess the contribution of this SO to the result indicator and an evaluation has not yet been undertaken. The evaluation of this SO will involve direct monitoring of the number of premises in postcodes served by NGA networks and that are able to receive superfast broadband services pre (baseline) and post project. The evaluation will consider other factors which may have had an effect on the result indicator, e.g. other, non-ERDF investment, business relocation.

Priority axis	5 - Technical Assistance
---------------	--------------------------

The only data available for the Technical Assistance result indicators are for the irregularity rate. As at end of 2016, the irregularity rate was 0.25%, within the target of less than 2%.

11.2. Specific actions taken to promote equality between men and women and to prevent discrimination, in particular accessibility for persons with disabilities, and the arrangements implemented to ensure the integration of the gender perspective in the operational programme and operations (Articles 50(4) and 111(4), second subparagraph, (e) of Regulation (EU) No 1303/2013)

The model used to build this Cross Curring Theme (CCT) into the Programmes embraces both vertical and horizontal measures. Vertical measures provide an opportunity to tackle particular issues e.g. removing barriers for female entrepreneurs, while horizontal measures raise the profile and encourage a learning process in relation to this cross cutting theme across a diverse range of organisations and activities e.g. improving workplace equality strategies.

WEFO's Cross Cutting Themes Team give on-going specialist advice to WEFO staff

and beneficiaries from an early stage in a project design to maximise the opportunities to integrate this CCT. A formal CCT assessment is carried out at Business Plan stage and recommendations made and commitments agreed; A continual programme of awareness raising and training is provided to stakeholders on how to integrate the CCTs; Guidance has been developed, together with best practice case study examples which provide specific information on how beneficiaries can address equal opportunities and gender mainstreaming within their operational plans; Regular monitoring of progress takes place at project review meetings and update reports are provided to the Programme Monitoring Committee (PMC) and other stakeholders.

Cross Cutting Theme Indicators and Targets

The inclusion of formal targets is an important driver to encourage projects to address issues and to monitor progress systematically over the life of the programme. However, as evidence gathered through the most recent Cross Cutting Theme Evaluation (2015) demonstrated, a formal target has limitations when it comes to validating the wide range of related activity which is being undertaken. In response to the evaluation findings, additional project level CCT indicators have therefore been identified, (agreed at the June 2015 PMC) which enable WEFO to capture this broader range of activity and enable good practice to be identified and reported.

11.3. Sustainable development (Articles 50(4) and 111(4), second subparagraph, (f) of Regulation (EU) No 1303/2013)

The model used to build the Cross Cutting Themes (CCTs) into the Programme embraces both vertical and horizontal measures. Vertical measures provide an opportunity to tackle particular issues e.g. developing new green technologies; While horizontal measures raise the profile and encourage a learning process in relation to the cross cutting themes across a diverse range of organisations and activities e.g. adding specific environmental enhancements to a capital build i.e. green roof, wildlife habitat.

WEFO's Cross Cutting Themes Team give on-going specialist advice to WEFO staff and beneficiaries from an early stage in a project design to maximise the opportunities to integrate this CCTs; A formal CCT assessment is carried out at Business Plan stage and recommendations made and commitments agreed; A continual programme of awareness raising and training is provided to stakeholders on how to integrate the CCTs; Guidance has been developed, together with best practice case study examples which provide specific information on how beneficiaries can address sustainable development within their operational plans; Regular monitoring of progress takes place at project review meetings and update reports are provided to the Programme Monitoring Committee (PMC) and other stakeholders.

Cross Cutting Theme Indicators and Targets

The inclusion of formal targets is an important driver to encourage projects to address issues and enables the monitoring of progress to take place systematically over the life of the programme. However, as evidence gathered through the most recent Cross Cutting Theme Evaluation (2015) demonstrated, a formal target has limitations when it comes to validating the wide range of related activity which is being undertaken. In response to the evaluation findings, additional project level CCT indicators have

therefore been identified, (agreed at the June 2015 PMC) which enable WEFO to capture this broader range of activity and enable good practice to be identified and reported.

11.4. Reporting on support used for climate change objectives (Article 50(4) of Regulation (EU) No 1303/2013)

Priority axis	Amount of support to be used for climate change objectives (EUR)	Proportion of total allocation to the operational programme (%)
3	4,437,500.00	19.81%
Total	4,437,500.00	2.18%

The above table shows the calculated amount of support to be used for climate change objectives based on approved Operations. The calculation is made based on a methodology, developed by the European Commission, which applies a specific weighting to the expenditure recorded against the codes of categorisation that have been assigned to operations in Table 7 of Section 3.4. The relevant weighting of 0%, 40% or 100% that apply to each code of intervention can be found at Annex 1 of the implementing regulation 215/2014. As at end December 2016 the amount of EU Grant of operations that is to be used in support of climate change objectives is €4.4m (just over 2% of the total allocation of the Programme).

Operations funded through the ERDF programmes are encouraged to include as part of climate resilient infrastructure the concept of embedding small scale green infrastructure strategies into project design.

Through the delivery of the Sustainable Development Cross Cutting Theme, operations are encouraged to consider a variety of climate resilient infrastructure (where appropriate) at design stage. Adapting to the changing climate is fundamental for the future and there is a need to build resilience to these unavoidable changes. For example, green infrastructures such as green roofs and walls, gardens, parks, productive landscapes, green corridors, and blue infrastructure such as bio-swales, porous paving and rain gardens as well as sustainable urban drainage systems (SUDS), play a vital role in creating climate-resilient development.

11.5. Role of partners in the implementation of the programme

Programme Monitoring Committee

A single Programme Monitoring Committee (PMC) has been established to cover all three ESI funds managed by the Welsh Government (ERDF, ESF, EAFRD) and provide strategic direction and oversight of the investments being made across Wales. Partners from private, public and third sectors (including economic and social partners, national, regional and local authorities; and representatives of civil society including environmental and equality bodies) form membership of the PMC. In 2016 the PMC

met four times. Decisions taken during 2016 by the PMC in relation to the Programme included:

- Approval of the 2015 Annual Implementation Reports for all ES&I Programmes
- Agreed for the Programme to support out of area activities for research capacity building operations supported by ERDF Priority 1, Specific Objective 1.1.

Delivery and Compliance Group

WEFO has established a Delivery and Compliance Group which meets on a quarterly basis to consider and review delivery and compliance issues affecting programme implementation for the European Structural Funds Programmes. The progress and membership of the Group is reviewed at regular intervals to ensure that membership continues to be representative of key partners and that the Group remains fit for purpose. Currently the group includes Sector representatives from Local Authorities, Higher Education and Further Education, Third Sector and Welsh Government.

The Compliance report is reviewed at each meeting and covers all themes raised through the various audit and compliance checks undertaken by the European Commission, ECA, Audit Authority and Management Verification Teams. The Group met four times during 2016. At those meetings particular emphasis was given to Procurement and Participant Eligibility requirements as these seemed to be giving Operations concern.

Monitoring and Evaluation Advisory Group

During 2016 WEFO set up the Monitoring and Evaluation Advisory Group (MEAG). The role of the MEAG is to help support WEFO produce robust monitoring and evaluation evidence on the ESI funds in Wales. The MEAG consists of partners from the private sector (London Economics), local government (Welsh Local Government Association and the Regional Engagement Teams), the voluntary sector (Wales Council for Voluntary Action) and higher education (Higher Education Funding Council for Wales). The MEAG met once during 2016. At the first meeting in September 2016 the MEAG discussed progress with the Ex Post Evaluations of the 2007-2013 Structural Funds, the 2014-2020 ESF Participants Survey and the ERDF Infrastructure Evaluation covering the 2000-2006 and 2007-2013 periods.

Regional Engagement Teams

Partners are also involved through Regional Engagement Teams based in North Wales, Mid Wales, Swansea Bay and South East Wales. Supported through Technical Assistance the teams help to improve the management and delivery of the Programme, ensuring regional integration of delivery and by contributing to the move towards a more strategic delivery model with a clearer framework for economic prioritisation by ensuring regional alignment and coherence of operations.

12. OBLIGATORY INFORMATION AND ASSESSMENT ACCORDING TO ARTICLE 111(4), FIRST SUBPARAGRAPH, (A) AND (B), OF REGULATION (EU) NO 1303/2013

12.1. Progress in implementation of the evaluation plan and the follow-up given to the findings of evaluations

During 2016 WEFO set up the Monitoring and Evaluation Advisory Group (MEAG). The role of the MEAG is to help support the Strategy Team (formerly known as the Research, Monitoring and Evaluation (RME) Team) produce robust monitoring and evaluation evidence on the ESI funds in Wales. The MEAG met once during 2016 (with a further meeting held in February 2017). At the first meeting in September 2016 the MEAG discussed progress with the Ex Post Evaluations of the 2007-2013 Structural Funds and RDP Programmes, the 2014-2020 ESF Participants Survey and the ERDF Infrastructure Evaluation covering the 2000-2006 and 2007-2013 periods. The MEAG also received a presentation on the RDP Glastir Woodland Element Up-take Survey, discussed the format of the Programme Monitoring Reports for the PMC and the plans for the forthcoming Evaluation Event and provided comments on the draft evaluation guidance for RDP Local Action Groups.

On 20 October 2016 WEFO held its annual information event. The afternoon of this event was exclusively focussed on evaluation. The event involved presentations on the initial findings from the Ex Post Evaluations of the 2017-2013 Structural Funds and RDP Programmes and Evaluation Workshops on Business Support (ERDF and RDP), Support for Individuals (ESF and RDP) and RDP Axes 3 and 4 type activity. Each workshop involved a presentation based on evaluation experience in the 2007-2013 period and a question and answer session with a discussion panel of people who have worked on evaluations of that subject.

During 2016 the WEFO Strategy Team regularly attended ERDF project inception and review meetings to advise projects on various monitoring and evaluation issues. The Strategy Team also provided comments on project monitoring and evaluation plans and draft project evaluation specifications.

During 2016 the Strategy Team has held a number of discussions on how to approach business surveying for the programmes. The Monitoring and Evaluation Strategy stated that business surveys would be undertaken at programme level but they would collect project level data to be used in project level evaluations so that they would not have to undertake their own surveys. However, the Strategy Team received feedback that ERDF projects prefer to manage their own surveys because they often want to survey their businesses for ongoing project management reasons as well as just for evaluation purposes. It was felt that the Strategy Team managing a programme level survey of businesses would duplicate this work. Discussions are still ongoing on this. Once the approach has been decided the Strategy Team will update the Monitoring and Evaluation Strategy.

The Strategy Team updated the PMC on progress against the Monitoring and Evaluation Strategy at a meeting in December 2016.

12.2. The results of the information and publicity measures of the Funds carried out under the communication strategy

WEFO has made signifigant progress in implementing the communications strategy for the Structural Funds programmes during 2016, having undertaken a range of information and publicity activities in order to promote the successes of the programmes overall, including ERDF East Wales.

Website

During 2016 the EU Funds section of the Welsh Government website was an important communications tool for ERDF West Wales and the Valleys, sourcing a range of information for project sponsors, partners, stakeholders and the media including news and a streamlined guidance library. The website also provided the latest achievements of ERDF programmes with a suite of case studies published showcasing the benefits and impact resulting from the funding. Fact sheets and infographics were also published for each region in Wales with images of ERDF funded projects to emphasise the contribution the fund has made to each county. The EU Funds section of the website received over 98,559 visits during 2016.

Twitter

Through Twitter, followers receive breaking news stories, including project announcements, events and progress of the programmes during 2016. Over 2,500 followers are also alerted to new content on the EU Funds section of the website such as progress information, guidance for sponsors, and All-Wales Programme Monitoring Committee papers. The Twitter channel was also used for the promotion of key campaigns, in particular Europe Day, in which sponsors were encouraged to tweet about their EU-funded projects using #EUFundsCymru. During 2016, 317 tweets were posted on our Twitter channel @wefowales and 298 via @wefocymru. In many cases our tweets were also posted on @welshgovernment with over 67,000 followers.

Events

WEFO held an annual information event in October 2016 attended by over 160 delegtes. The event provided information to sponsors and stakeholders on best practice in delivering projects and workshops on monitoring and evaluation across the Structural Funds programmes, including ERDF. During the event, the EU Funds Publicity Awards 2016 were held, celebrating the achievements of EU project sponsors in communicating their activities

The aim of the awards was to recognise sponsors who had gone one step further in publicising and communicating the impact of their EU projects. Also, to reinforce that publicity is an important aspect of delivering EU-funded projects and that raising the visibility of EU funds is essential to demonstrate the real benefits to people, businesses and communities. Live tweets were posted during the event, generating:

- 185 retweets;
- 170 likes;
- Over 300 engagements.

The winners were announced by the Finance Secretary and took part in a photo opportunity along with their trophies and certificates. Live tweets were posted during

the event promoting the success of the sponsors.

Press and Publicity

Media / Press activity during 2016 focused on project approvals, launches, project/programme milestones and good news stories which gained widespread media coverage. Some 40 press notices were issued during 2016 promoting the overall programmes. There were over 572 press cuttings referencing EU funds were noted and achieved, on average, over 96% positive coverage during the programming period. In particular, for ERDF West Wales and the Valleys, 16 press notices were issued, including:

- £15.1m ERDF for the FLEXIS project led by Cardiff University delivered in East Wales and West Wales and the Valleys to research flexible energy systems to support modern day challenges.
- £2.3m ERDF for the Social Business Growth Fund, led by WCVA, to grow and develop social enterprises (also WW&V).

Plaques

Interior and exterior EU commemorative plaques have been an excellent way of promoting the EU funds contribution to schemes across Wales. During 2016, over 600 plaques were issued to project sponsors and beneficiaries to display in areas visible to the general public.

Promotional Items

During 2016, WEFO continued to utilise a range of promotional tools and activities to communicate the success of the programmes. These included canvas bags, mugs, highlighters and pens. WEFO attended a number of conferences and events, displaying stands, information and literature to promote and raise awareness of the programmes, including displays at various project milestone events.

Throughout the programming period WEFO worked closely with project sponsors on their information and publicity requirements to ensure effective promotion of ESF and ERDF funds via press notices, events, website etc.

13. ACTIONS TAKEN TO FULFILL EX-ANTE CONDITIONALITIES (ARTICLE 50(4) OF REGULATION (EU) NO 1303/2013) (MAY BE INCLUDED IN REPORT TO BE SUBMITTED IN 2016 (SEE POINT 9 ABOVE). REQUIRED IN REPORT SUBMITTED IN 2017) OPTION: PROGRESS REPORT

Not applicable to the Programme.

14. ADDITIONAL INFORMATION WHICH MAY BE ADDED DEPENDING ON THE CONTENT AND OBJECTIVES OF THE OPERATIONAL PROGRAMME (ARTICLE 111(4), SECOND SUBPARAGRAPH, (A), (B), (C), (D), (G) AND (H), OF REGULATION (EU) NO 1303/2013)

14.1. Progress in the implementation of the integrated approach to territorial development, including development of regions facing demographic challenges and permanent or natural handicaps, sustainable urban development, and community led local development under the operational programme

led local development under the operational programme		
No actions applicable to the Programme have been implemented during the reporting period.		
14.2. Progress in the implementation of actions to reinforce the capacity of Member State authorities and beneficiaries to administer and use the Funds		
No actions applicable to the Programme have been implemented during the reporting period.		
14.3. Progress in the implementation of any interregional and transnational actions		
No actions applicable to the Programme have been implemented during the reporting period.		
14.4. Where appropriate, the contribution to macro-regional and sea basin strategies		
As stipulated by the Regulation (EU) No 1303/2013, article 27(3) on the "content of programmes", article 96(3)(e) on the "content, adoption and amendment of operational programmes under the Investment for growth and jobs goal", article 111(3), article (4)(d) on "implementation reports for the Investment for growth and jobs goal", and Annex 1, section 7.3 on "contribution of mainstream programmes to macro-regional and sea-basin strategies, this programme contributes to MRS(s) and/or SBS:		
No actions applicable to the Programme have been implemented during the reporting period.		
☐ EU Strategy for the Baltic Sea Region (EUSBSR)		
☐ EU Strategy for the Danube Region (EUSDR)		

EU Strategy for the Adriatic and Ionian Region (EUSAIR)
EU Strategy for the Alpine Region (EUSALP)
Atlantic Sea Basin Strategy (ATLSBS)

ATLSBS

Priority(s) and objective(s) that the programme is relevant to:

Priority	Objective
1 - Promote entrepreneurship and innovation	1.1 - Sharing knowledge between higher education organisations, companies and research centers
1 - Promote entrepreneurship and innovation	1.2 - Enhancement of competitiveness and innovation capacities in the maritime economy of the Atlantic area
1 - Promote entrepreneurship and innovation	1.3 - Fostering adaptation and diversification of economic activities by promoting the potential of the Atlantic area
2 - Protect, secure and develop the potential of the Atlantic marine and coastal environment	2.1 - Improving maritime safety and security
2 - Protect, secure and develop the potential of the Atlantic marine and coastal environment	2.2 - Exploring and protecting marine waters and coastal zones
2 - Protect, secure and develop the potential of the Atlantic marine and coastal environment	2.3 - Sustainable management of marine resources
2 - Protect, secure and develop the potential of the Atlantic marine and coastal environment	2.4 - Exploitation of the renewable energy potential of the Atlantic area's marine and coastal environment
3 - Improve accessibility and connectivity	3.1 - Promoting cooperation between ports
4 - Create a socially inclusive and sustainable model of regional development	4.1 - Fostering better knowledge of social challenges in the Atlantic area
4 - Create a socially inclusive and sustainable model of regional development	4.2 - Preserving and promoting the Atlantic's cultural heritage

Actions or mechanisms used to better link the programme with the Atlantic SBS

A. Are the Sea Basin Strategic coordinators (mainly National Coordinators, Priority Area Coordinators or members, and/or Objective coordinators or members) participating in the Monitoring Committee of the programme?		
Yes □ No □		
B. In selection criteria, have extra points been attributed to specific measures supporting the ATLSBS?		
Yes □ No □		
C. Has the programme invested EU funds in the ATLSBS?		
Yes □ No □		
D. Obtained results in relation to the ATLSBS (n.a. for 2016)		

14.5. Progress in the implementation of actions in the field of social innovation, where appropriate

No actions applicable to the Programme have been implemented during the reporting period.

14.6. Progress in the implementation of measures to address the specific needs of geographical areas most affected by poverty or of target groups at highest risk of poverty discrimination or social exclusion, with special regard to marginalised communities and persons with disabilities, long term unemployment and young people not in employment including, where appropriate, the financial resources used

No actions applicable to the Programme have been implemented during the reporting period.

15. FINANCIAL INFORMATION AT PRIORITY AXIS AND PROGRAMME LEVEL (ARTICLES 21(2) AND 22(7) OF REGULATION (EU) NO 1303/2013)

This section is not applicable to the 2016 AIR.

16. SMART, SUSTAINABLE AND INCLUSIVE GROWTH (OPTION PROGRESS REPORT)SMART, SUSTAINABLE AND INCLUSIVE GROWTH (OPTION PROGRESS REPORT)

Information on and assessment of the programme contribution to achieving the Union strategy for smart, sustainable and inclusive growth. Information on and assessment of the programme contribution to achieving the Union strategy for smart, sustainable and inclusive growth.

This section is not applicable to the 2016 AIR.	

17. ISSUES AFFECTING THE PERFORMANCE OF THE PROGRAMME AND MEASURES TAKEN — PERFORMANCE FRAMEWORK (ARTICLE 50(2) OF REGULATION (EU) NO 1303/2013)

Where the assessment of progress made with regard to the milestones and targets set out in the performance framework demonstrates that certain milestones and targets have not been achieved, Member States should outline the underlying reasons for failure to achieve these milestones in the report of 2019 (for milestones) and in the final implementation report (for targets).

This section is not applicable to the 2016 AIR.	