From: Laing, James <James.Laing@cyfoethnaturiolcymru.gov.uk>
Sent: 22 May 2019 13:35
To: Gillett, Frances (ESNR-Environment-Decarbonisation&Energy) <Frances.Gillett@gov.wales>
Cc: ED Filing <EDFiling@cyfoethnaturiolcymru.gov.uk>
Subject: FW: Y Bryn Project - Ministerial Advice

### Ref: BO / Bryn

Frances

Mike has provided the information below to answer your second query.

James

From: Pitcher, Mike
Sent: 22 May 2019 13:23
To: Laing, James <<u>James.Laing@cyfoethnaturiolcymru.gov.uk</u>>
Subject: RE: Y Bryn Project - Ministerial Advice

James

I propose the following:

The selection process for the preferred bidder was set out in the Request for Proposals document (RFP). It was a three stage process as follows:

Stage 1: This was a pass/fail gateway where we checked the financial health of the bidders, their track record in delivery and any prosecutions they may have received in terms of environmental or health and safety compliance. All ten bidders passed this gateway.

#### Stage 2: Technical Requirements:

In this section we scored the technical aspects of the proposal from each bidder. This focussed on scoring how well the bidders demonstrated an understanding of the constraints and opportunities of the site and how well they had taken these into account in coming up with a credible proposal. This section covered the turbine layout on site and also access to the grid and access to site for construction.

The preferred bidder scored 74/100 in this section. It was consistently strong at a technical and environmental level and was the second highest out of the ten bids in the Stage 2 assessment.

#### Stage 3: Financial and Local Benefit Requirements:

This section was divided into two sub-sections. The Financial section scored the quantum of the financial offer which was expressed as a rental payable as a % of the Gross Revenue of the project, with additional payments during the Option and Construction phases of the project. We also scored the quality of their financial model in order to test that the rental levels being offered were supported by a credible financial model.

The preferred bidder was significantly the highest scoring bid for their financial offer achieving 43/45 for this section of the bid.

The Local Benefit section of the scoring considered 3 factors which were weighted as follows:

- Evidence of how they would approach the identification of beneficiaries for local benefit (experience and proposals for consultation) (worth 20%)
- The quantum of local benefit (worth 60%)
- Their approach to wider local benefit (jobs and supply chains) (worth 20%)

The preferred bidder was also the highest scoring bid in this section. They were consistently strong across these three criteria but in particular made the highest local benefit offer consisting of:

- £8,000/MW installed (compared to the industry standard of £5,000)
- 20% local benefit share offer made up of 10% community and 10% public sector

They scored a total overall score of 83% with the next highest bidder scoring 73%.

Mike

From: Laing, James
Sent: 22 May 2019 08:02
To: Pitcher, Mike <<u>Mike.Pitcher@cyfoethnaturiolcymru.gov.uk</u>>
Cc: Frances Gillett (<u>frances.gillett@gov.wales</u>) <<u>frances.gillett@gov.wales</u>>
Subject: FW: Y Bryn Project - Ministerial Advice

Mike

Can you deal please.

Thanks

James

From: Frances.Gillett@gov.wales <Frances.Gillett@gov.wales> Sent: 21 May 2019 16:14 To: Laing, James <James.Laing@cyfoethnaturiolcymru.gov.uk> Cc: Charlotte.Gibson@gov.wales; Jennifer.Pride1@gov.wales Subject: RE: Y Bryn Project - Ministerial Advice

James

Please could you confirm details about the successful bid, what they were offering (including the share offer) and why they were picked? I know you ran through this in your presentation but it would be useful to have a record of this information.

# Thanks

#### Frances

Frances Gillett Renewable Energy Policy Officer/Swyddog Polisi Ynni Adnewyddadwy, Onshore Renewable Energy Policy Team/Y Tîm Polisi Ynni Adnewyddadwy ar y Tir, Decarbonisation and Energy Division/Is-adran Datgarboneiddio ac Ynni, Welsh Government/Llywodraeth Cymru Rhodfa Padarn, Llanbadarn Fawr, Aberystwyth, Ceredigion, SY23 3UR Tel/Ffon: 0300 062 2469 E-Mail/Ebost: <u>frances.gillett@gov.wales</u>

From: Laing, James <<u>James.Laing@cyfoethnaturiolcymru.gov.uk</u>>
Sent: 21 May 2019 14:20
To: Gillett, Frances (ESNR-Environment-Decarbonisation&Energy) <<u>Frances.Gillett@gov.wales</u>>
Subject: Y Bryn Project - Ministerial Advice



PBP3 Bryn Project PID Final v. post Board.do

### **Official - Sensitive**

Frances

NRW Board cleared Y Bryn Project today so here is info for MA briefing. I have been told by Wendy Burris, WG that Peter Macdonald will sign off before going to Minister.

Appreciate this list is a starter for 10.

Let me know what else you need and more docs to follow.

Can I get sight of your MA draft?

James

From: Frances.Gillett@gov.wales <Frances.Gillett@gov.wales> Sent: 14 May 2019 11:08 To: Laing, James <<u>James.Laing@cyfoethnaturiolcymru.gov.uk</u>> Subject: Section 83

# James

As discussed, I started putting together a list of information it might be useful for me to have when putting up a Section 83 briefing:

• Name and location of the land including Local Authority.

The land falls under the local authorities of Neath Port Talbot and Bridgend County Borough Councils in South Wales (PID p1).

• Correct description of the land, including size of area affected and an Ordnance Map at the relevant scale and with the boundary of the land for disposal identified.

See Env Assessment p4 Section 2.1.2 Site Characteristics and map of site. Area of land to be leased not known until planning completed which will identify development footprint.

• What NRW is applying to do (e.g. put lease offer out to tender for renewables development).

Y Bryn Project marketing exercise was the exercise in putting area within SSA F out to open tender via S2W. We are at the stage of notifying the preferred Bidder as shared with you on 13/5/2019.

• Confirmation NRW have completed their own governance processes (i.e. has the project plan received scrutiny from NRW's Board, including legal scrutiny).

Scrutiny from NRW ET on 30/4/2019 and NRW Board was today 21/5/2019. Legal scrutiny provided by Eversheds (external).

• Details of any other interested parties (e.g. developers' organisational name, and name, email address, address and telephone number of key contact within that organisation).

**10 bidders submitted an offer through open market tender.** 

• Details or estimate of rental income to be received by NRW and Welsh Government.

£36m - 39m over life of project.

- Anticipated lease length.
   25 year operational lease.
- Details of access to land and access that may be impacted See Env. Assessment p4 Section 2.1.5 Forest Access.
- Details of designations? (SSSI's, SAMs, SACs etc).
   See Env. Assessment p7 Section 2.3 Designated Sites and p 9 Section 4.1 Heritage.
- Any risks or issues (i.e. land lease isn't being put out to tender and is only being offered to a single developer).

Was treated as open market opportunity.

# Thanks

### Frances

Frances Gillett Renewable Energy Policy Officer/Swyddog Polisi Ynni Adnewyddadwy, Onshore Renewable Energy Policy Team/Y Tîm Polisi Ynni Adnewyddadwy ar y Tir, Decarbonisation and Energy Division/Is-adran Datgarboneiddio ac Ynni, Welsh Government/Llywodraeth Cymru Rhodfa Padarn, Llanbadarn Fawr, Aberystwyth, Ceredigion, SY23 3UR Tel/Ffon: 0300 062 2469 E-Mail/Ebost: frances.gillett@gov.wales

From: Pitcher, Mike <Mike.Pitcher@cyfoethnaturiolcymru.gov.uk>
Sent: 13 May 2019 14:53
To: Gillett, Frances (ESNR-Environment-Decarbonisation&Energy) <Frances.Gillett@gov.wales>
Cc: Laing, James <James.Laing@cyfoethnaturiolcymru.gov.uk>
Subject: presentation



Gweithredwr y Rhaglan Darparu Ynni/Energy Delivery Programme Executive Cyfoeth Naturiol Cymru/Natural Resources Wales

Ffon/Tel: 0300 0654629 Ffon symudol/Mobile: 07772 871923

E-bost: mike.pitcher@cyfoethnaturiolcymru.gov.uk

E-mail: <u>mike.pitcher@naturalresourceswales.gov.uk</u>

Gwefan: <u>www.cyfoethnaturiolcymru.gov.uk</u> Website: <u>www.naturalresourceswales.gov.uk</u>

Ein diben yw sicrhau bod adnoddau naturiol Cymru yn cael eu cynnal, eu gwella a'u defnyddio yn gynaliadwy, yn awr ac yn y dyfodol.

Our purpose is to ensure that the natural resources of Wales are sustainably maintained, enhanced and used, now and in the future.

Twitter: twitter.com/NatResWales Facebook: facebook.com/NatResWales Flichr: Flickr.com/NatResWales Youtube: youtube.com/NatResWales

From: Laing, James <James.Laing@cyfoethnaturiolcymru.gov.uk>
Sent: 03 June 2019 08:28
To: Gillett, Frances (ESNR-Environment-Decarbonisation&Energy) <Frances.Gillett@gov.wales>
Cc: Griffiths, Rhodri M (OFM - Communications) <Rhodri.Griffiths@gov.wales>; Pride, Jennifer (ESNR-Environment-Energy Water & Flood) <Jennifer.Pride1@gov.wales>; Parry, Sara (OFM - Communications) <Sara.Parry@Gov.Wales>; Gough, Martyn <Martyn.Gough@cyfoethnaturiolcymru.gov.uk>; Pitcher, Mike <Mike.Pitcher@cyfoethnaturiolcymru.gov.uk>
Subject: RE: Bryn project

Frances

The answer is yes and timeline is to notify success Bidder by end of June 2019.

James

From: Frances.Gillett@gov.wales <Frances.Gillett@gov.wales>
Sent: 31 May 2019 15:20
To: Laing, James <James.Laing@cyfoethnaturiolcymru.gov.uk>
Cc: Rhodri.Griffiths@gov.wales; Jennifer.Pride1@gov.wales; Sara.Parry@Gov.Wales
Subject: Bryn project

#### James

With regards to comms, will we be releasing a joint press notice, after the successful bidder has been informed? This was the approach we took with the Alwen project.

#### Kind regards

## Frances

Frances Gillett Renewable Energy Policy Officer/Swyddog Polisi Ynni Adnewyddadwy, Onshore Renewable Energy Policy Team/Y Tîm Polisi Ynni Adnewyddadwy ar y Tir, Decarbonisation and Energy Division/Is-adran Datgarboneiddio ac Ynni, Welsh Government/Llywodraeth Cymru Rhodfa Padarn, Llanbadarn Fawr, Aberystwyth, Ceredigion, SY23 3UR Tel/Ffon: 0300 062 2469 E-Mail/Ebost: <u>frances.gillett@gov.wales</u>

From: Gillett, Frances (ESNR-Environment-Decarbonisation&Energy)
Sent: 29 May 2019 08:18
To: Laing, James <James.Laing@cyfoethnaturiolcymru.gov.uk>
Subject: RE: Y Bryn Project - Ministerial Advice

# Thanks James

Frances Gillett Renewable Energy Policy Officer/Swyddog Polisi Ynni Adnewyddadwy, Onshore Renewable Energy Policy Team/Y Tîm Polisi Ynni Adnewyddadwy ar y Tir, Decarbonisation and Energy Division/Is-adran Datgarboneiddio ac Ynni, Welsh Government/Llywodraeth Cymru Rhodfa Padarn, Llanbadarn Fawr, Aberystwyth, Ceredigion, SY23 3UR Tel/Ffon: 0300 062 2469 E-Mail/Ebost: frances.gillett@gov.wales

From: Laing, James <<u>James.Laing@cyfoethnaturiolcymru.gov.uk</u>>
Sent: 28 May 2019 09:29
To: Gillett, Frances (ESNR-Environment-Decarbonisation&Energy) <<u>Frances.Gillett@gov.wales</u>>
Cc: Pitcher, Mike <<u>Mike.Pitcher@cyfoethnaturiolcymru.gov.uk</u>>
Subject: RE: Y Bryn Project - Ministerial Advice

#### Official – Sensitive

Frances

The highest overall scoring bid and successful Bidder was Coriolis Energy Ltd and ESB Consortium.

James

From: Frances.Gillett@gov.wales <Frances.Gillett@gov.wales> Sent: 24 May 2019 11:48 To: Laing, James <James.Laing@cyfoethnaturiolcymru.gov.uk> Cc: ED Filing <EDFiling@cyfoethnaturiolcymru.gov.uk> Subject: RE: Y Bryn Project - Ministerial Advice

James

Please could you confirm who the successful bidder was?

Many thanks

# Frances

Frances Gillett Renewable Energy Policy Officer/Swyddog Polisi Ynni Adnewyddadwy, Onshore Renewable Energy Policy Team/Y Tîm Polisi Ynni Adnewyddadwy ar y Tir, Decarbonisation and Energy Division/Is-adran Datgarboneiddio ac Ynni, Welsh Government/Llywodraeth Cymru Rhodfa Padarn, Llanbadarn Fawr, Aberystwyth, Ceredigion, SY23 3UR Tel/Ffon: 0300 062 2469 E-Mail/Ebost: frances.gillett@gov.wales

From: Gillett, Frances (ESNR-Environment-Decarbonisation&Energy)
Sent: 04 June 2019 17:44
To: 'Laing, James' <James.Laing@cyfoethnaturiolcymru.gov.uk>
Cc: Burris, Wendy (ESNR - Rural Economy & Legislation) <Wendy.Burris@gov.wales>; Gibson,
Charlotte (ESNR-Strategy-Decarbonisation&Energy) <Charlotte.Gibson@gov.wales>; Pride, Jennifer
(ESNR-Environment-Energy Water & Flood) <Jennifer.Pride1@gov.wales>;
KateGoodby.KathrynJones (Mail Box) <KateGoodby.KathrynJones@gov.wales>; Parry, Sara (OFM - Communications) <Sara.Parry@Gov.Wales>; Griffiths, Rhodri M (OFM - Communications) <Rhodri.Griffiths@gov.wales>; Pitcher, Mike <Mike.Pitcher@cyfoethnaturiolcymru.gov.uk>
Subject: Y Bryn Project

# James

Please note the Minister for Environment, Energy and Rural Affairs has noted the intention of Natural Resources Wales (NRW) to inform Coriolis Energy Ltd and ESB Consortium of their success following their proposal to develop a wind farm on Welsh Government Estate land within the Penhydd and Margam forest blocks, the opportunity known as Y Bryn Project. She has also noted NRW's intention to release a press notice to publicise the preferred bidder, shortly after the preferred bidder is informed at the end of June. The press notice will include a quote from the Minister.

# Kind regards

# Frances

Frances Gillett Renewable Energy Policy Officer/Swyddog Polisi Ynni Adnewyddadwy, Onshore Renewable Energy Policy Team/Y Tîm Polisi Ynni Adnewyddadwy ar y Tir, Decarbonisation and Energy Division/Is-adran Datgarboneiddio ac Ynni, Welsh Government/Llywodraeth Cymru Rhodfa Padarn, Llanbadarn Fawr, Aberystwyth, Ceredigion, SY23 3UR Tel/Ffon: 0300 062 2469 E-Mail/Ebost: <u>frances.gillett@gov.wales</u> From: Owen, Lowri <Lowri.Owen@cyfoethnaturiolcymru.gov.uk>
Sent: 12 July 2021 11:39
To: Lewis, Huw (ESNR-Strategy-Decarbonisation & Energy) <Huw.Lewis3@gov.wales>
Cc: Pitcher, Mike <Mike.Pitcher@cyfoethnaturiolcymru.gov.uk>; Laing, James
<James.Laing@cyfoethnaturiolcymru.gov.uk>; Grace, Elsie
<elsie.grace@cyfoethnaturiolcymru.gov.uk>; ED Filing <EDFiling@cyfoethnaturiolcymru.gov.uk>
Subject: FW: Y Bryn wind farm proposal

Hi Huw,

Mike is on leave this week, but he has asked me to respond to your question in his absence.

NRW were given approval by the Welsh Government, via a S83 consent, to put Y Bryn to the market as a renewable energy development opportunity in 30th May 2018.

NRW ran the tender process between 28th June 2018 and 3rd December 2018 and the successful bidder Coriolis Energy and ESB was notified on 28th June 2019. A range of criteria were used to select the preferred bidder which took account of track record, environmental, technical, social and financial factors.

Coriolis Energy and ESB formed a Special Purpose Vehicle company called Y Bryn Wind Farm Limited in whose name they signed an Option Agreement with the Welsh Ministers in 2020. This Option agreement provides Y Bryn Wind Farm Limited the exclusive right to develop a planning submission on the site based upon the layout which they submitted in their bid. If they are successful in obtaining a planning consent the Option agreement gives them the right to draw down a lease to build and operate the wind farm.

In terms of the wattage output of the wind farm, the bidders in their tenders provided an indicative output for each turbine. The actual wattage output will only be determined when the developer selects a preferred turbine supplier, and this only happens after they have planning consent, so at the tender stage the wattage is indicative based on the number of turbines. The Option and lease have an agreed layout in terms of the number of turbines but they do not contractually bind the developer to the wattage output of the turbines.

In terms of roles and responsibilities, NRW manage the land on behalf of the Welsh Ministers. NRW are responsible for managing the forestry land within which the wind farm will be built, and also act on the Welsh Ministers' behalf in managing the terms of the Option and Lease. This involves the collection of rent and other payments on behalf of the Welsh Government, and managing the access by Coriolis and ESB to undertake their survey work and ensuring that Coriolis and ESB take full account of future forest management issues in the detailed design of the windfarm.

NRW are also identified as a statutory consultee under various legislation which relate to development planning. NRW maintain a separation of duties between this function and its land management responsibilities. Within development planning NRW's role is to provide advice on the potential impact of development on Wales' natural resources and environment.

If you require anything else, please let me know.

Diolch,

Lowri Syrfewr Chefnogi Technegol/ Technical Support Surveyor

Cyfoeth Naturiol Cymru / Natural Resources Wales Aberystwyth

Siaradwr Cymraeg

Yn falch o arwain y ffordd at ddyfodol gwell i Gymru trwy reoli'r amgylchedd ac adnoddau naturiol yn gynaliadwy.

Proud to be leading the way to a better future for Wales by managing the environment and natural resources sustainably.

cyfoethnaturiol.cymru / naturalresources.wales

Twitter | Facebook | LinkedIn | Instagram

Correspondence in Welsh is welcomed, and we will respond in Welsh without it leading to a delay

From: Huw.Lewis3@gov.wales <Huw.Lewis3@gov.wales>
Sent: 07 July 2021 14:22
To: Pitcher, Mike <<u>Mike.Pitcher@cyfoethnaturiolcymru.gov.uk</u>>; Grace, Elsie
<<u>elsie.grace@cyfoethnaturiolcymru.gov.uk</u>>
Cc: Erica.Hawes@gov.wales
Subject: Y Bryn wind farm proposal

Hi Mike, Elsie

I'm after input to correspondence the Minister for Climate Change has received from David Rees, Member of the Senedd for Aberavon, about Y Bryn wind farm proposal. Mr Rees asks specific questions about NRW's role in the tender and lease process. I have copied the text below. Please can you consider and provide a response to me by **CoP 12 July**.

Could you also please provide details as to whether any agreement exists, in principle or otherwise, between the developers of the proposal, Coriolis Energy & ESB, and Welsh Government and/or NRW either as part of the tender process for the wind farm or subsequent to the success of Coriolis Energy & ESB in being awarded the tender for the development of this land parcel for a wind farm. Additionally, what, if any, Wattage output was agreed at the tender stage and what discussions have been held since the awarding of the tender to Coriolis Energy in relation to the Wattage output for the wind farm that was to be developed. I would also welcome clarification on the role of NRW in each of the following: the tendering process, in the management of the land to be leased, in the receipt of payment for the lease. It is critical for public reassurance that their roles in these areas is open and transparent given that NRW also plays a role in the environmental safeguards that will be required by this development together with a consultee on the planning application.

Many thanks

Huw Lewis

Yr Is-adran Ynni / Energy Division Y Gyfarwyddiaeth Newid Hinsawdd, Ynni a Chynllunio / Climate Change, Energy and Planning Directorate Llywodraeth Cymru / Welsh Government

Ffôn / Tel: 03000 258258